



LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 8

FOURTH SESSION, FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE

PRAYER

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

The following Bills were read a First Time and had their purposes outlined:

(No. 7) – The Highway Traffic Amendment Act (Immediate Roadside Prohibitions)/Loi modifiant le Code de la route (imposition immédiate de sanctions)

(Hon. Mr. CULLEN)

(No. 201) – The Health Services Insurance Amendment Act (Personal Care Home Staffing Guidelines)/Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'assurance-maladie (lignes directrices en matière de dotation applicables aux foyers de soins personnels)

(Mr. SWAN)

(No. 202) – The Public Schools Amendment Act (Small Classes for K to 3)/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les écoles publiques (faible effectif des classes)

(Mr. WIEBE)

(No. 207) – The Manitoba Conservation Officers Recognition Day Act/Loi sur la Journée de reconnaissance des agents de conservation du Manitoba

(Mr. LAGIMODIERE)

Mr. NESBITT, Vice-Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Legislative Affairs, presented its First Report, which was read as follows:

Meetings

Your Committee met on the following occasions in the Legislative Building:

- November 16, 2017 (2nd Session – 41st Legislature)
- November 28, 2018 (4th Session – 41st Legislature)

Matters under Consideration

- Annual Report of Elections Manitoba for the year ending December 31, 2016 including the conduct of the 41st Provincial General Election, April 19, 2016
- Annual Report of Elections Manitoba, including the conduct of the Point Douglas by-election, and a proposal to modify the voting process, for the year ending December 31, 2017

Committee Membership

Committee membership for the November 16, 2017 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Hon. Mrs. COX
- Hon. Mr. CULLEN
- Hon. Mr. FIELDING
- Ms. FONTAINE
- Hon. Mr. GERRARD
- Mrs. GUILLEMARD (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. JOHNSTON
- Hon. Mrs. STEFANSON
- Mr. SWAN
- Mr. TEITSMA (*Vice-Chairperson*)

Committee membership for the November 28, 2018 meeting:

- Mr. ALLUM
- Hon. Mr. CULLEN
- Ms. FONTAINE
- Hon. Mr. GOERTZEN
- Mrs. GUILLEMARD (*Chairperson*)
- Mr. HELWER
- Ms. LAMOUREUX
- Mr. LINDSEY
- Mr. MICHALESKI
- Mr. NESBITT
- Mr. WOWCHUK

Your Committee elected Mr. NESBITT as the Vice-Chairperson

Officials speaking on the record at the November 16, 2017 meeting:

- Ms. Shipra Verma, Chief Electoral Officer

Officials speaking on the record at the November 28, 2018 meeting:

- Ms. Shipra Verma, Chief Electoral Officer

Reports Considered and Passed

Your Committee considered and passed the following report as presented:

- Annual Report of Elections Manitoba for the year ending December 31, 2016 including the conduct of the 41st Provincial General Election, April 19, 2016
- Annual Report of Elections Manitoba, including the conduct of the Point Douglas by-election, and a proposal to modify the voting process, for the year ending December 31, 2017

On motion of Mr. NESBITT, the Report of the Committee was received.

Pursuant to Rule 27(1), Hon. Mrs. MAYER and Messrs. MARCELINO (Tyndall Park), LAGIMODIERE, MARTIN and LAMONT made Members' Statements.

The following petitions were presented and read:

Mr. LINDSEY – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reinstate obstetric delivery services at Flin Flon General Hospital and work with the Government of Saskatchewan, and the Federal Government, to ensure obstetric services continue to be available on a regional basis. (R. Reeves, D. Gudbranson, L. Richardson and others)

Mr. WIEBE – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the decision to close Concordia Hospital's emergency room so that families and seniors in northeast Winnipeg and the surrounding areas have timely access to quality health care services.

Hon. Mr. FLETCHER – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to take the necessary steps to ensure that the Vimy Arena site is not used for an addiction treatment facility and to take the necessary steps to ensure the preservation of public land along Sturgeon Creek for the purposes of park land and recreational activities for public use (including being an important component of the Sturgeon Creek Greenway Trail and the Sturgeon Creek ecosystem) under the current designation of PR2 for the 255 Hamilton Avenue location at the Vimy Arena site, and to maintain the land to continue to be designated for Parks and Recreation Active Neighbourhood/Community.

Mr. SWAN – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request that the Provincial Government consider establishing a cross-departmental team to provide leadership on a culturally appropriate, coordinated response to the growing addictions crisis in our province that includes an aggressive, wide-spread education campaign on the dangers of using methamphetamine and opiates along with addictions education for front-line medical staff in health care facilities, to consider providing additional addictions services in Brandon and Western Manitoba across the continuum of care including acute response, detoxification, long-term rehabilitation, transitional housing, and support for managing co-occurring disorders, to request that the Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living consider establishing a publicly available inventory of all addictions facilities in Manitoba, and to consider providing supports for the families of people struggling with addiction including counseling, patient navigation and advocacy, and direct access to free naloxone. (L. Woods, N. Woods, D. Woods and others)

Hon. Mr. GERRARD – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to request Dynacare to reopen the closed laboratories or allow Diagnostic Services of Manitoba to freely open labs in clinics which formerly housed labs that have been shut down by Dynacare and to ensure high quality lab services for patients, and a level playing field and competition in the provision of laboratory services to medical offices as well to address this matter immediately in the interest of better patient focused care and improved support for health professionals. (D. Heinrich, R. Gislason, G. Jones and others)

The House resumed the debate on the Proposed Motion of Mr. SMITH (Southdale):

THAT the following address be presented to Her Honour the Lieutenant Governor:

We, the Members of the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba thank your Honour for the gracious speech addressed to us at this Fourth Session of the Forty-First Legislature of Manitoba.

And the debate continuing,

And the proposed amendment moved by Mr. KINEW as follows:

THAT the Motion be amended by adding the following words at the end:

But this House regrets that the Provincial Government has:

- a) refused to invest in resources for addictions, such as detox beds, treatment beds or a safe injection site, for families suffering the effects of the methamphetamine crisis which is gripping Winnipeg, Brandon and other areas of Manitoba while spending hundreds of thousands on an advertising campaign to warn of the dangers of cannabis with no corresponding campaign for methamphetamine; and
- b) continued to undermine the front line health care services that Manitoba families and seniors rely on by pushing ahead with the closure of emergency rooms and urgent care centres, ending obstetric services in Flin Flon, eliminating outpatient physiotherapy and occupational therapy services and coverage for sleep apnea supports while threatening important services, like CancerCare, with the prospect of further cuts; and
- c) put the health care system at further risk by refusing to invest in nurses and instead forced nurses and other front line health care workers to the brink of exhaustion and fatigue through the Premier's plans for cuts and consolidation; and
- d) continued the attack on women's health care in Manitoba by refusing to provide real access to necessary reproductive health services like the abortion pill for all Manitoba women and girls, closing the Mature Women's Health Centre and cutting lactation supports services and the midwifery program; and
- e) ignored the needs for vulnerable seniors by failing to build one new personal care home bed for another year; and
- f) cut supports for life saving medication through the Special Drug Program for those suffering from diabetes, cystic fibrosis and other debilitating diseases while making no effort to support the creation of a real, publicly and universally accessible Pharmacare program; and
- g) failed to acknowledge that the Premier's cuts have exacerbated the wait times for hip, knee and cataract surgeries which have worsened by significant margins since 2016; and
- h) failed to apply a gender-based lens to its policies and to help increase representation of women across society; and

- i) disrespected the message clearly stated by climate science as no plan or initiative has been presented to fight climate change or global warming, nor has there been any offer to provide real protections for lakes and rivers especially Lake Winnipeg or to help lower and middle income Manitobans access green options on top of a failure to remove subsidies for big oil and gas polluters; and
- j) continued to pick fights with municipalities, including the City of Winnipeg, by refusing to work collaboratively or cooperatively in making unilateral cuts such as the ending of the Municipal Roads and Bridges Program, dictating massive cuts to the infrastructure budget while freezing transit budgets and ending historic partnerships to support transit; and
- k) failed to offer a jobs plan which can address the challenges facing the province as Manitoba's unemployment rate rises, an unconstitutional wage freeze is imposed, front line public sector jobs are cut and private sector companies move good paying jobs to other jurisdictions, including the United States; and
- l) ignored the needs of northern and rural Manitobans who are looking for an economic plan that keeps education affordable and accessible, by cutting important programs like the Northern Patient Transportation Program; and
- m) failed for another year to put forward a comprehensive poverty reduction strategy that raises families and children out of the cycle of poverty and has instead decided to attack the most vulnerable in society by cutting Rent Assist and freezing the minimum wage for two years while giving multi-million dollar contracts to high priced consultants instead of listening to regular families and front line workers; and
- n) cut small class sizes for early learners, failed to properly fund or create a truly publicly accessible, high-quality child care system, while refusing to fund K-12 education at the rate of economic growth while engaging in a review which will set the stage for more cuts; and
- o) continued to increase tuition for post-secondary education, especially colleges, while cutting training spots in colleges, making it more difficult for regular families to get the education and training they need to secure good jobs close to home and ending the tuition income tax rebate which helped make university and college more affordable; and
- p) pushed ahead with a plan to privatize Lifeflight Air Ambulance services in spite of front line doctors warning the province of the dire consequences of that plan; and
- q) eliminated health coverage for international students at the same time as instituting a new \$500 fee for participants in the Provincial Nominee Program; and

- r) failed again to present any commitments to build new social or affordable housing or a provincial housing strategy despite having promised to do so repeatedly while having sold off affordable housing or eliminated requirements for affordable housing in projects; and
- s) failed to meaningfully consult with Indigenous peoples and their representatives, made offensive and divisive comments regarding Indigenous groups and has ignored the Pathway to Reconciliation laid out by *The Path to Reconciliation Act*, the Truth and Reconciliation Commission “Calls to Action” and the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples; and
- t) broken its promise to deliver real reforms to families in Manitoba after cutting support for restorative justice programs while making cuts to services that help families navigate difficult court proceedings like family conciliation services all while crime rises in Winnipeg; and
- u) failed to make any clear commitments to invest in needed health care services in Brandon or Westman; and
- v) continued to lay the groundwork for the privatization of Manitoba Hydro while refusing to keep rates affordable for regular Manitoba families; and
- w) failed to offer any plan to keep cell phone rates affordable for regular families while cheerleading corporate mergers of big telecommunication companies; and
- x) failed to condemn the Federal Government for its approach to climate change which allows big coal polluters in Saskatchewan to avoid a price on pollution while the Federal Government makes cuts to health care transfers; and
- y) failed to implement the recommendations of the Conflict of Interest Commissioner’s report; and
- z) hurt young farmers with the Provincial Government’s changes to the Crown lands program making it harder for small family farms in Manitoba to access Crown lands.

As a consequence of these and many other failings, the Provincial Government has thereby lost the trust and confidence of the people of Manitoba and this House.

And the proposed sub-amendment moved by Mr. LAMONT as follows:

THAT the motion be amended by adding after clause (z) the following clauses:

- aa) failed to commit to stop charging Manitoba Hydro exorbitant fees which increases the debt level and prevents the corporation from returning to financial health; and
- bb) failed to commit to strengthen government revenues and develop a credible plan to balance the budget based on growth and investment instead of cuts; and
- cc) failed to commit to raising standards for ethics, integrity and conflict of interest; and

- dd) failed to commit to investing in prevention to help keep Manitobans healthy and independent; and
- ee) failed to commit to create an addictions strategy to address to the methamphetamine and opioid crises; and
- ff) failed to commit to spending local and stop hiring consultants from outside the province; and
- gg) failed to commit to not dismantling Manitoba's school divisions and keeping community input in education systems; and
- hh) failed to commit to restoring le Bureau de l'éducation française; and
- ii) failed to address the issue of contaminated sites in St. Boniface and Weston in Winnipeg after years of reports which were not disclosed; and
- jj) failed to commit to reversing the decisions to dismantle collaborative health care teams and increase senior management positions in health by creating another bureaucratic arm of the government with Shared Health Services; and
- kk) failed to commit to improving issues relating to supportive housing, independent living, hospice and personal care homes or reversing the decision to raise costs on Senior Care Programs; and
- ll) failed to commit to community and employee input and evidence based outcomes for health care changes and placing insulin pumps and hearing aids under Medicare; and
- mm) failed to commit to ending the practice of clawing back the children's special allowances from kids in CFS, particularly those who are in unpaid care; and
- nn) failed to commit to recognizing the role of agricultural producers and support them in reducing Manitoba's carbon footprint; and
- oo) failed to commit to improving the outdated technology systems utilized in government departments; and
- pp) failed to commit to reversing the decision to close health care facilities such as the Corydon Primary Care Clinic and the vital rural EMS stations; and
- qq) failed to commit to fulfilling the 2017 provincial budget promise of releasing the Poverty Reduction Plan by the end of 2017; and
- rr) failed to commit to addressing the urgent need for First Nations housing or developing Emergency Management protocols for northern and remote communities; and
- ss) failed to commit to implementing, together with First Nations and Metis people in Manitoba, a plan to improve nutrition and to decrease diabetes in the Province; and

- tt) failed to commit to developing strategies to work with the Federal Government to ensure that all Manitoba First Nation communities have better access to improved nursing stations, health care, clean running water, internet and phone connectivity, teachers and land and air transportation; and
- uu) failed to commit to fulfilling the 2016 Throne Speech promises of creating a new provincial housing strategy, providing for self-regulation for Manitoba's paramedics, reforming conflict of interest laws or the Look North Recommendation of updating and releasing the "Duty to Consult" framework for Indigenous communities; and
- vv) failed to commit to fulfilling the Provincial Government's election promises of raising the personal tax exemption to the national average, fast tracking the construction of 1200 personal care home beds, opening a dedicated stroke unit, developing a mental health and addictions strategy and to work positively and respectfully with Indigenous people and communities; and
- ww) failed to commit to implementing the eco-certification of the fisheries of Lake Winnipeg, Lake Manitoba and Lake Winnipegosis and to ensuring sustainable fisheries of walleye, sauger, whitefish, tullibee and perch for these lakes; and
- xx) failed to commit to ensuring that full fire prevention and community protection plans are in place for all First Nations Communities including firebreaks where needed; and
- yy) failed to put a priority on addressing learning disabilities to help children in the K to 12 education system to do well; and
- zz) failed to cooperate with the City of Winnipeg to implement an accelerated process to address sewage discharge into the Assiniboine and Red Rivers in order to improve the health of Lake Winnipeg.

And the debate continuing on the sub-amendment,

And Mr. MALOWAY, Hon. Mr. FLETCHER, Ms. LATHLIN, Hon. Ms. CLARKE, Mr. JOHNSTON and Hon. Mr. PALLISTER having spoken.

And the Question being put on the sub-amendment. It was negatived, on the following division:

YEA

ALLUM
ALTEMEYER
FONTAINE
GERRARD
KINEW
LAMONT
LAMOUREUX
LATHLIN

LINDSEY
MALOWAY
MARCELINO (Logan)
MARCELINO (Tyndall Park)
SARAN
SMITH (Point Douglas)
SWAN
WIEBE 16

NAY

BINDLE	MAYER
CLARKE	MICHALESKI
COX	MICKLEFIELD
CULLEN	MORLEY-LECOMTE
CURRY	NESBITT
EICHLER	PALLISTER
EWASKO	PEDERSEN
FIELDING	PIWNIUK
FRIESEN	REYES
GOERTZEN	SCHULER
GRAYDON	SMITH (Southdale)
GUILLEMARD	SQUIRES
HELWER	STEFANSON
ISLEIFSON	TEITSMA
JOHNSON	WHARTON
JOHNSTON	WISHART
LAGASSÉ	WOWCHUK
LAGIMODIERE	YAKIMOSKI 37
MARTIN	

And the Question being put on the amendment. It was negated, on the following division:

YEA

ALLUM	LINDSEY
ALTEMEYER	MALOWAY
FONTAINE	MARCELINO (Logan)
GERRARD	MARCELINO (Tyndall Park)
KINEW	SARAN
LAMONT	SMITH (Point Douglas)
LAMOUREUX	SWAN
LATHLIN	WIEBE 16

NAY

BINDLE
CLARKE
COX
CULLEN
CURRY
EICHLER
EWASKO
FIELDING
FRIESEN
GOERTZEN
GRAYDON
GUILLEMARD
HELWER
ISLEIFSON
JOHNSON
JOHNSTON
LAGASSÉ
LAGIMODIERE
MARTIN

MAYER
MICHALESKI
MICKLEFIELD
MORLEY-LECOMTE
NESBITT
PALLISTER
PEDERSEN
PIWNIUK
REYES
SCHULER
SMITH (Southdale)
SQUIRES
STEFANSON
TEITSMA
WHARTON
WISHART
WOWCHUK
YAKIMOSKI 37

And the Question being put on the main motion. It was agreed to, on the following division:

YEA

BINDLE
CLARKE
COX
CULLEN
CURRY
EICHLER
EWASKO
FIELDING
FRIESEN
GOERTZEN
GRAYDON
GUILLEMARD
HELWER
ISLEIFSON
JOHNSON
JOHNSTON
LAGASSÉ
LAGIMODIERE
MARTIN

MAYER
MICHALESKI
MICKLEFIELD
MORLEY-LECOMTE
NESBITT
PALLISTER
PEDERSEN
PIWNIUK
REYES
SCHULER
SMITH (Southdale)
SQUIRES
STEFANSON
TEITSMA
WHARTON
WISHART
WOWCHUK
YAKIMOSKI 37

NAY

ALLUM
ALTEMEYER
FONTAINE
GERRARD
KINEW
LAMONT
LAMOUREUX
LATHLIN

LINDSEY
MALOWAY
MARCELINO (Logan)
MARCELINO (Tyndall Park)
SARAN
SMITH (Point Douglas)
SWAN
WIEBE 16

The House then adjourned at 4:50 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Monday, December 3, 2018.

Hon. Myrna DRIEDGER,
Speaker.