

Fourth Session - Thirty-Eighth Legislature
of the
Legislative Assembly of Manitoba
Standing Committee
on
Public Accounts

Chairperson
Mr. Jack Reimer
Constituency of Southdale

Vol. LVII No. 1 - 6 p.m., Monday, November 28, 2005

ISSN 1713-9462

MANITOBA LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY
Thirty-Eighth Legislature

Member	Constituency	Political Affiliation
AGLUGUB, Cris	The Maples	N.D.P.
ALLAN, Nancy, Hon.	St. Vital	N.D.P.
ALTEMEYER, Rob	Wolseley	N.D.P.
ASHTON, Steve, Hon.	Thompson	N.D.P.
BJORNSON, Peter, Hon.	Gimli	N.D.P.
BRICK, Marilyn	St. Norbert	N.D.P.
CALDWELL, Drew	Brandon East	N.D.P.
CHOMIAK, Dave, Hon.	Kildonan	N.D.P.
CULLEN, Cliff	Turtle Mountain	P.C.
CUMMINGS, Glen	Ste. Rose	P.C.
DERKACH, Leonard	Russell	P.C.
DEWAR, Gregory	Selkirk	N.D.P.
DOER, Gary, Hon.	Concordia	N.D.P.
DRIEDGER, Myrna	Charleswood	P.C.
DYCK, Peter	Pembina	P.C.
EICHLER, Ralph	Lakeside	P.C.
FAURSCHOU, David	Portage la Prairie	P.C.
GERRARD, Jon, Hon.	River Heights	Lib.
GOERTZEN, Kelvin	Steinbach	P.C.
HAWRANIK, Gerald	Lac du Bonnet	P.C.
HICKES, George, Hon.	Point Douglas	N.D.P.
IRVIN-ROSS, Kerri	Fort Garry	N.D.P.
JENNISSEN, Gerard	Flin Flon	N.D.P.
JHA, Bidhu	Radisson	N.D.P.
KORZENIOWSKI, Bonnie	St. James	N.D.P.
LAMOUREUX, Kevin	Inkster	Lib.
LATHLIN, Oscar, Hon.	The Pas	N.D.P.
LEMIEUX, Ron, Hon.	La Verendrye	N.D.P.
MACKINTOSH, Gord, Hon.	St. Johns	N.D.P.
MAGUIRE, Larry	Arthur-Virden	P.C.
MALOWAY, Jim	Elmwood	N.D.P.
MARTINDALE, Doug	Burrows	N.D.P.
McGIFFORD, Diane, Hon.	Lord Roberts	N.D.P.
MELNICK, Christine, Hon.	Riel	N.D.P.
MITCHELSON, Bonnie	River East	P.C.
MURRAY, Stuart	Kirkfield Park	P.C.
NEVAKSHONOFF, Tom	Interlake	N.D.P.
OSWALD, Theresa, Hon.	Seine River	N.D.P.
PENNER, Jack	Emerson	P.C.
REID, Daryl	Transcona	N.D.P.
REIMER, Jack	Southdale	P.C.
ROBINSON, Eric, Hon.	Rupertsland	N.D.P.
ROCAN, Denis	Carman	P.C.
RONDEAU, Jim, Hon.	Assiniboia	N.D.P.
ROWAT, Leanne	Minnedosa	P.C.
SALE, Tim, Hon.	Fort Rouge	N.D.P.
SANTOS, Conrad	Wellington	N.D.P.
SCHELLENBERG, Harry	Rossmere	N.D.P.
SCHULER, Ron	Springfield	P.C.
SELINGER, Greg, Hon.	St. Boniface	N.D.P.
SMITH, Scott, Hon.	Brandon West	N.D.P.
STEFANSON, Heather	Tuxedo	P.C.
STRUTHERS, Stan, Hon.	Dauphin-Roblin	N.D.P.
SWAN, Andrew	Minto	N.D.P.
TAILLIEU, Mavis	Morris	P.C.
<i>Vacant</i>	Fort Whyte	P.C.
WOWCHUK, Rosann, Hon.	Swan River	N.D.P.

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA
THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS

Monday, November 28, 2005

TIME – 6 p.m.

LOCATION – Winnipeg, Manitoba

CHAIRPERSON – Mr. Jack Reimer (Southdale)

VICE-CHAIRPERSON – Mr. Jim Maloway (Elmwood)

ATTENDANCE – 11 QUORUM – 6

Members of the Committee present:

Hon. Mr. Selinger

Messrs. Caldwell, Cummings, Hawranik,
Lamoureux, Maguire, Maloway, Martindale,
Nevakshonoff, Reimer, Santos

APPEARING:

Ms. Bonnie Lysyk, Deputy Auditor General and
Chief Operating Officer, Office of the Auditor
General

MATTERS UNDER CONSIDERATION:

Provincial Auditor's Report on Compliance and
Special Audits for the fiscal year ended March
31, 2001

Provincial Auditor's Report – Investigation of an
Adult Learning Centre ("The Program") in
Morris-Macdonald School Division No. 19 dated
September 2001

Auditor General's Report – Value-for-Money
Audit, Student Financial Assistance Program
dated September 2002

Auditor General's Report – Audit of the Public
Accounts for the year ended March 31, 2002

Auditor General's Report – An Examination of
RHA Governance in Manitoba dated January
2003

Auditor General's Report – Dakota Tipi First
Nation Gaming Commission and First Nation
Gaming Accountability in Manitoba dated
March 2003

Auditor General's Report – Investigation of
Hecla Island Land and Property Transactions
dated August 2003

Auditor General's Report – An Examination of
Le Collège de Saint-Boniface dated August 2003

Annual Report of the Operations of the Office of
the Auditor General for the fiscal year ended
March 31, 2003

Auditor General's Report – Follow-up on
Previously Issued Recommendations on
Business Planning and Performance
Measurement Report dated December 2003

Auditor General's Report – Audit of the Public
Accounts for the year ended March 31, 2003

Auditor General's Report – Information
Technology Report dated March 2004

Auditor General's Report – A Review of Crown
Corporations Council and Compliance Audits
dated March 2004

Auditor General's Report – Attributes of
Managing and Reporting Results: A Survey of
Senior Management dated March 2004

Auditor General's Report – Investigation of
Hydra House Ltd. and Review of the related
Department of Family Services and Housing
Financial Accountability Framework dated June
2004

Annual Report of the Operations of the Office of
the Auditor General for the fiscal year ended
March 31, 2004

Auditor General's Report – Investigation of
Maintenance Branch of the Manitoba Housing
Authority dated November 2004

Auditor General's Report – Audit of the Public
Accounts for the year ended March 31, 2004

Auditor General's Report – Voluntary Sector
Grant Accountability: Perspectives and Practices
– Enhancing Board Governance in Not-For-
Profit Organizations Report dated February
2005

Auditor General's Report – Examination of the
Crocus Investment Fund dated May 2005

Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of the
Recommendations made in our August 2003

Report, an Examination of Le Collège de Saint-Boniface dated July 2005

Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Report Recommendations – A Review dated July 2005

Annual Report of the Operations of the Office of the Auditor General for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2005

Auditor General's Report – Environmental Audit – Review of the Province of Manitoba's Management of Contaminated Sites and the Protection of Well Water Quality in Manitoba dated November 2005

Public Accounts Volumes 1, 2, 3 and 4 of March 31, 2003

Public Accounts Volumes 1, 2, 3 and 4 of March 31, 2004

Public Accounts Volumes 1, 2, 3 and 4 of March 31, 2005

* * *

Mr. Chairperson: Will the Standing Committee on Public Accounts please come to order.

Several reports have been referred to the committee for our consideration this evening. On November 24, '05, letters were sent to committee members requesting submissions for agenda items or questions requiring detailed answers. As we did not receive any agenda items for this meeting, we will be considering the reports already referred to the committee as was outlined in the committee notice.

Does the committee wish me to read out the names of the reports that have been referred to this evening's meeting?

An Honourable Member: No.

Mr. Chairperson: Thank you.

Are there any suggestions from the committee as to how long we will sit this evening? May I make the suggestion, since this is more or less a clean-up meeting, that, after we have gone through the reports, possibly at that time we can entertain the suggestion to adjourn? *[Agreed]*

I will now invite the honourable Minister of Finance (Mr. Selinger) to make any opening statement, and I would ask that he please—oh, I forgot one other thing. Before the minister speaks, are there any suggestions regarding the order in which we consider these reports or the process that the

committee wishes to follow for this evening's meeting?

Mr. Gerald Hawranik (Lac du Bonnet): Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair. We are prepared to move on the following reports. I would like to put this in front of the committee: first of all, the Provincial Auditor's Report on Compliance and Special Audits for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2001; the Auditor General's Report – Value-for-Money Audit, Student Financial Assistance Program dated September 2002; the Auditor General's Report – Audit of the Public Accounts for the year ended March 31, 2002; the Auditor General's Report – An Examination of Le Collège de Saint-Boniface dated August 2003; the Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations made in our August 2003 Report, an Examination of Le Collège de Saint-Boniface dated July 2005; the Auditor General's Report – Information Technology Report dated March 2004; the Auditor General's Report – Attributes of Managing and Reporting Results: A Survey of Senior Management dated March 2004; the Annual Report of the Operations of the Office of the Auditor General for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2003; the Annual Report of the Operations of the Office of the Auditor General for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2004; and, finally, the Annual Report of the Operations of the Office of the Auditor General for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2005.

Mr. Kevin Lamoureux (Inkster): We did have some concerns in regard to several of the Auditor's reports, and I did not make a special note of the ones that my colleague in opposition had made mention to. I just want to indicate that the reports which we do not feel comfortable in terms of passing today: the Auditor General's report regarding the Dakota Tipi First Nation Gaming Commission and the First Nation gaming accountability in Manitoba dated March 2003.

We still have concerns in regard to the Auditor General's Report – Investigation of Hecla Island Land and Property Transactions dated August 2003.

In addition, the Auditor General's report in regard to the investigation of Hydra House Ltd.; the Auditor General's report for the examination of the Crocus Fund; and the Auditor General's report regarding the Environmental Audit – Review of the Province of Manitoba's Management of Contaminated Sites and the Protection of Well Water Quality in Manitoba dated November 2005; and, in

addition to that, Volumes 1, 2 and 3 of the Public Accounts dated March 31, 2005.

* (18:10)

We could possibly pass the Provincial Auditor's Report – Investigation of an Adult Learning Centre at the end of this evening as a possibility. Those are the ones that we are concerned about, that we would not want to see passed this evening.

Mr. Hawranik: Yes. For further clarification, the 10 reports that I did mention earlier are the reports that we are prepared to move on. We are not prepared to pass any of the other reports that are on the list at all. So, just the 10 are the only ones that I would prefer to move on this evening.

Mr. Chairperson: That was my understanding also. The rest of the reports that were not mentioned would stay, still to be—

An Honourable Member: So the ones I mentioned will stay?

Mr. Chairperson: Yes, the ones you mentioned will stay.

Before we proceed with the passage of these bills, I will ask the minister whether he had any comments.

Hon. Greg Selinger (Minister of Finance): No, I do not.

Mr. Chairperson: Thank you, Mr. Minister.

I will ask the official opposition, Mr. Hawranik, whether you have any comments.

Mr. Hawranik: No, we do not.

Mr. Chairperson: Then I will ask the Deputy Auditor General whether she has any comments.

Ms. Bonnie Lysyk (Deputy Auditor General and Chief Operating Officer, Office of the Auditor General): If it pleases the committee, prior to each report being moved and passed, we could do a brief summation of the report for the benefit of the committee, but we leave that at your discretion.

Mr. Chairperson: What is the will of the committee as we proceed? Would we want a summation?

An Honourable Member: No.

Mr. Chairperson: No? Okay.

Well, then, I will go through the list of the reports that we are willing to pass at this time.

The Provincial Auditor's Report on Compliance and Special Audits for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2001—pass; Auditor General's Report – Value-for-Money Audit, Student Financial Assistance Program dated September 2002—pass.

Auditor General's Report – Audit of the Public Accounts for the year ended March 31, 2002. Shall the report pass?

Some Honourable Members: Pass.

Mr. Chairperson: Pass. Oh, sorry.

Mr. Lamoureux: Mr. Chair, I know only because I went through a process back in 1988 in which things kind of passed a little bit too quickly—[interjection] The member from Elmwood recalls a comment of "not now." I just want the assurance, as you are passing these committees, I am prepared to accept the expediting of the passage of these things, but that none of these reports that I have listed will, in fact, pass. I look to assurances from the Chair, because the list that you are reading off is not the same list that I have in terms of sequence. So I do not want to see something passed that I have indicated I did not want passed.

Mr. Chairperson: If you like, I have extra copies of the list that Mr. Hawranik listed off. The only other one that is on this list that will not pass is the Auditor General's Report – Investigation of the Maintenance Branch of Manitoba Housing dated 2004. That one will not pass. So I will give this list to you.

Now we are at the third one.

The Auditor General's Report – Audit of the Public Accounts for the year ended March 31, 2002—pass; Auditor General's Report – An Examination of Le Collège de Saint-Boniface dated August 2003—pass; Auditor General's Report – Follow-up of Recommendations made in our August 2003 Report, an Examination of Le Collège de Saint-Boniface dated July 2005—pass; Auditor General's Report – Information Technology Report dated March 2004—pass; Auditor General's Report – Attributes of Managing and Reporting Results: A Survey of Senior Management dated March 2004—pass; Annual Report of the Operations of the Office of the Auditor General for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2003—pass; Annual Report of the Operations of the Office of the Auditor General for the fiscal year ended

March 31, 2004—pass; Annual Report of the Operations of the Office of the Auditor General for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2005—pass.

Since this concludes the business of the committee, what is the will of the committee?

An Honourable Member: Committee rise.

Mr. Chairperson: Committee rise.

Well, one other thing. I would ask that you please leave the reports on the table, because there are not that many copies, individually.

Committee rise.

COMMITTEE ROSE AT: 6:16 p.m.