

**Fourth Session – Forty-First Legislature**  
of the  
**Legislative Assembly of Manitoba**  
**DEBATES**  
and  
**PROCEEDINGS**  
**Official Report**  
**(Hansard)**

*Published under the  
authority of  
The Honourable Myrna Driedger  
Speaker*

**Vol. LXXII No. 57 - 1:30 p.m., Monday, May 27, 2019**

ISSN 0542-5492

**MANITOBA LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY**  
**Forty-First Legislature**

<b>Member</b>	<b>Constituency</b>	<b>Political Affiliation</b>
ALLUM, James	Fort Garry-Riverview	NDP
ALTEMEYER, Rob	Wolseley	NDP
BINDLE, Kelly	Thompson	PC
CLARKE, Eileen, Hon.	Agassiz	PC
COX, Cathy, Hon.	River East	PC
CULLEN, Cliff, Hon.	Spruce Woods	PC
CURRY, Nic	Kildonan	PC
DRIEDGER, Myrna, Hon.	Charleswood	PC
EICHLER, Ralph, Hon.	Lakeside	PC
EWASKO, Wayne	Lac du Bonnet	PC
FIELDING, Scott, Hon.	Kirkfield Park	PC
FLETCHER, Steven, Hon.	Assiniboia	Man.
FONTAINE, Nahanni	St. Johns	NDP
FRIESEN, Cameron, Hon.	Morden-Winkler	PC
GERRARD, Jon, Hon.	River Heights	Lib.
GOERTZEN, Kelvin, Hon.	Steinbach	PC
GRAYDON, Clifford	Emerson	Ind.
GUILLEMARD, Sarah	Fort Richmond	PC
HELWER, Reg	Brandon West	PC
ISLEIFSON, Len	Brandon East	PC
JOHNSON, Derek	Interlake	PC
JOHNSTON, Scott	St. James	PC
KINEW, Wab	Fort Rouge	NDP
KLASSEN, Judy	Kewatinook	Lib.
LAGASSÉ, Bob	Dawson Trail	PC
LAGIMODIERE, Alan	Selkirk	PC
LAMONT, Dougald	St. Boniface	Lib.
LAMOUREUX, Cindy	Burrows	Lib.
LATHLIN, Amanda	The Pas	NDP
LINDSEY, Tom	Flin Flon	NDP
MALOWAY, Jim	Elmwood	NDP
MARCELINO, Flor	Logan	NDP
MARCELINO, Ted	Tyndall Park	NDP
MARTIN, Shannon	Morris	PC
MAYER, Colleen, Hon.	St. Vital	PC
MICHALESKI, Brad	Dauphin	PC
MICKLEFIELD, Andrew	Rossmere	PC
MORLEY-LECOMTE, Janice	Seine River	PC
NESBITT, Greg	Riding Mountain	PC
PALLISTER, Brian, Hon.	Fort Whyte	PC
PEDERSEN, Blaine, Hon.	Midland	PC
PIWNIUK, Doyle	Arthur-Virden	PC
REYES, Jon	St. Norbert	PC
SARAN, Mohinder	The Maples	Ind.
SCHULER, Ron, Hon.	St. Paul	PC
SMITH, Andrew	Southdale	PC
SMITH, Bernadette	Point Douglas	NDP
SMOOK, Dennis	La Verendrye	PC
SQUIRES, Rochelle, Hon.	Riel	PC
STEFANSON, Heather, Hon.	Tuxedo	PC
SWAN, Andrew	Minto	NDP
TEITSMA, James	Radisson	PC
WHARTON, Jeff, Hon.	Gimli	PC
WIEBE, Matt	Concordia	NDP
WISHART, Ian	Portage la Prairie	PC
WOWCHUK, Rick	Swan River	PC
YAKIMOSKI, Blair	Transcona	PC

**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA**

**Monday, May 27, 2019**

*The House met at 1:30 p.m.*

**Madam Speaker:** O Eternal and Almighty God, from Whom all power and wisdom come, we are assembled here before Thee to frame such laws as may tend to the welfare and prosperity of our province. Grant, O merciful God, we pray Thee, that we may desire only that which is in accordance with Thy will, that we may seek it with wisdom and know it with certainty and accomplish it perfectly for the glory and honour of Thy name and for the welfare of all our people. Amen.

Please be seated. Good afternoon, everybody.

**ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

**INTRODUCTION OF BILLS**

**Bill 217—The Manitoba Hydro Amendment Act**

**Mr. Tom Lindsey (Flin Flon):** I move, seconded by the member from Minto, that Bill 217, The Manitoba Hydro Amendment Act, be now read a first time.

*Motion presented.*

**Mr. Lindsey:** Bill 217, The Manitoba Hydro Amendment Act, is an act that would require the government to hold a referendum when they wish to create a subsidiary of Manitoba Hydro. This would ensure openness and transparency of the government's actions as well as allow the public participation in a publicly owned corporation. Excuse me.

So, Madam Speaker, I think this a very important bill, and I'm glad that I got to introduce it today. Thank you.

**Madam Speaker:** Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the motion? Agreed? *[Agreed]*

**COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**Standing Committee on Social  
and Economic Development  
First Report**

**Mr. Dennis Smook (Chairperson):** I wish to present the First Report of the Standing Committee on Social and Economic Development.

**Clerk (Ms. Patricia Chaychuk):** Your Standing Committee on Social—

**Some Honourable Members:** Dispense.

**Madam Speaker:** Dispense.

*Your Standing Committee on Social and Economic Development presents the following as its First Report.*

**Meetings**

*Your Committee met on May 23, 2019 at 6:00 p.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.*

**Matters under Consideration**

- **Bill (No. 31) – The Tobacco Tax Amendment Act / Loi modifiant la Loi de la taxe sur le tabac**

**Committee Membership**

- *Hon. Mr. FIELDING*
- *Mr. LAMONT*
- *Mr. PIWNIUK*
- *Mr. REYES*
- *Mr. MARCELINO (Tyndall Park)*
- *Hon. Mr. SCHULER*
- *Mrs. SMITH (Point Douglas)*
- *Mr. SMITH (Southdale)*
- *Mr. SMOOK (Chairperson)*
- *Mr. SWAN*
- *Hon. Mr. WHARTON*

*Your Committee elected Mr. PIWNIUK as the Vice-Chairperson.*

**Public Presentations**

*Your Committee heard the following presentation on Bill (No. 31) – The Tobacco Tax Amendment Act / Loi modifiant la Loi de la taxe sur le tabac:*

*Sarah Hawkins, Canadian Cancer Society*

**Bill Considered and Reported**

- **Bill (No. 31) – The Tobacco Tax Amendment Act / Loi modifiant la Loi de la taxe sur le tabac**

*Your Committee agreed to report this Bill, without amendment.*

**Mr. Smook:** I move, seconded by the honourable member for Arthur-Virden (Mr. Piwniuk), that the report of the committee be received.

*Motion agreed to.*

**Madam Speaker:** Tabling of reports? Ministerial statements?

## MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

### Paul Chapman

**Mr. Wayne Ewasko (Lac du Bonnet):** Madam Speaker, it is my honour today to rise in the Chamber to pay tribute to former mayor of Lac du Bonnet, Mr. Paul Chapman.

In 1983, Paul Chapman was appointed to council by the town of Lac du Bonnet in a by-election. I quote: I figured I'd straighten out the town in a couple of years and be gone, end quote, Paul said with a laugh 27 years later.

Paul's family has a political history in the community, as his grandfather, Joe Sparman, served as the first mayor of Lac du Bonnet in 1948. Following in his grandfather's footsteps, in 2003 Paul became mayor of Lac du Bonnet.

During Paul's reign, the community of Lac du Bonnet saw major infrastructure improvements, including a new water treatment plant and replacing deteriorating water mains within the community. With the closure of Tembec's mill in Pine Falls and Tanco mine in Lac du Bonnet, promoting the area's tourism became a top priority for Paul to maintain and encourage economic growth.

Aside from his duties on council, Paul was instrumental in establishing the Winnipeg River Brokenhead Community Futures Development Corp. His dedication to his community didn't go unnoticed and, in 2004, Paul Chapman received the Minister's Award for Excellence in CFDC Volunteerism.

In 2008, Paul was awarded his 25-year pin from the Association of Manitoba Municipalities, where he attributed his success and longevity in politics to his mother, Elsie, noting that, I quote: If it wasn't for her encouragement, I wouldn't be here. End quote.

During his reign as mayor for the town of Lac du Bonnet, Paul Chapman became director of the board for Manitoba Good Roads Association, and in April of 2013, he received the MGRA lifetime membership award in recognition of his exemplary service.

Paul Chapman's 27-year career in municipal politics came to an end in 2010, but he continues to be tireless—to be a tireless fundraiser for the Manitoba lotteries MS walk in Lac du Bonnet and has singlehandedly raised over \$177,000 since he first took part in the walk in 1997.

I would like to take this opportunity to commend Paul Chapman both on his 27 years of service in municipal politics and his continuing volunteerism and fundraising efforts.

You are an inspiration to all of us who choose to serve in any level of government, and your dedication to growth and prosperity of our community has truly benefitted the residents of Eastman area, and for that, we thank you.

### Danny Schur

**Mr. James Allum (Fort Garry-Riverview):** As we recognize the incredible historical significance of the Winnipeg General Strike, I rise today to pay tribute to my friend and Riverview's own: the incomparable Danny Schur.

Many have noted that the trenchant issues fought during the Winnipeg General Strike have resonance today, but it is Danny—a multi-talented writer, musician, composer, director and producer—who, more than anyone, has brought these issues to life.

His critically acclaimed musical, *Strike!*, which has been featured in documentary films and adapted into a CBC national radio special, not only captures the tenor of this seminal era of labour unrest, but brilliantly renders the humanity at the heart of the strike.

It is therefore with much anticipation that we eagerly await the movie *Stand!*, which will premiere in this, the centennial year of the Winnipeg General Strike. In bringing *Strike!* to the stage and *Stand!* to the silver screen, Danny has made a singular contribution to our cultural history unlike few others.

Danny began his JUNO Award-winning career in the 1990s, and with his wonderful wife, the divine Juliane Schaible, wrote the theme song for the 1999 Pan Am Games, an event which also has great historical significance in Winnipeg and Manitoba.

He also combined his proud Ukrainian heritage with his passion for hockey in the film, made in Manitoba: the Terry Sawchuk story, a fantastic movie about another tragic hero who Danny rightly has called the Wayne Gretzky of goalies.

Now, of all—I also have to note, Madam Speaker, having played a lot of hockey with Danny, that he is the only goalie I know who keeps score, does the play-by-play, adds colour commentary and stops the puck, all at the same time.

Congratulations, Danny, on your many achievements and your contribution to our shared cultural history. You're a true cosmopolitan, my friend: worldly in your art yet profoundly grounded in your own identity. I'm always proud to call you my friend, but today I honour you as a talented artist, an inspired storyteller, and a great Manitoban and Canadian.

\*(13:40)

I ask all members to stand with me to today to honour the one and only Danny Schur.

#### **Pembina Valley Twisters MMJHL Champions**

**Mr. Shannon Martin (Morris):** It was standing room only at the Morris Arena on Tuesday, April 30th, as the Manitoba Major Junior Hockey League was about to come to conclusion.

It was a helluva series as the Pembina Valley Twisters found themselves in game 7 of the series of a run for the Jack McKenzie Trophy against the St. James Canucks. It didn't look good for the home team at the halfway point of the game. With half of the second period over, the Canucks had potted four unanswered goals; the score was Twisters 0, Canucks 4.

I'll be honest, if I wasn't standing rinkside with one of the owners, I may have made for the exit.

But in true Twister fashion, things began to turn around. The Twisters started scoring with a goal by Travis Penner at 13:43 of the second period. A power play goal by T.J. Matuszewski cut the deficit in half, and a goal by Nick Hatley left the score Twisters 3, Canucks 4 at the end of the second period.

With fresh wind in their sails and a fresh drink in my hand, the Twisters Nico Vigier popped in a power-play goal to tie the score. Then, at 11:34 of the third period, Jeremie Goderis cinched the deal to put the Twisters ahead 5-4.

Despite efforts by both teams, this score held, and the Twisters ended the season with the Jack McKenzie Trophy held high in their hands as jubilant fans cheered their admiration.

So, on behalf of the Manitoba Legislative Assembly, congratulations to the Pembina Valley Twisters on a great season. The Twisters were No. 1 in the league, earning the Art Moug Trophy, and capped it off by winning the playoffs.

Congrats also to the St. James Jr. Canucks for a great series, taking it to seven games and playing a great, albeit futile, final game.

Before I conclude, it is worth noting that the Twisters are more than a hockey organization. They are a community-minded group who, over the last ten years, have raised almost \$170,000 for CancerCare Manitoba.

This year's \$32,000 effort was divided between CancerCare Manitoba and Urijah Dyck, a local five-year-old that was diagnosed in 2018 with T-cell leukemia and lymphoma.

Thank you, Twisters, for always putting your heart into everything.

#### **Gloria Cardwell-Hoepfner**

**Mr. Andrew Swan (Minto):** Madam Speaker, those who know the West End know that it is a great place to live, work and play. Today I want to recognize a person who has led the way in spreading the word about the West End, Gloria Cardwell-Hoepfner, who is retiring after 12 years as the executive director of the West End BIZ.

The West End BIZ is the largest in Winnipeg, including approximately 1,100 businesses and organizations in its catchment area, as well as 35,000 residents.

In her time as E.D., the West End BIZ has become a loud and proud supporter and defender of one of Canada's most fascinating communities. Just a few accomplishments under Gloria's leadership include an award-winning Open for Business project, innovative advertising campaigns, the expansion of the BIZ Patrol, the strengthening of the mural program as well as tours which were named by Where magazine as a top-10 attraction in Canada, the graffiti removal team serving businesses and residents alike, various grant programs to assist businesses, a West End restaurant guide that should be in the pocket or purse of every Winnipegger, the Saigon Park gateway feature stage on Ellice, the Community Corner on Sargent at Maryland, the community crossing development on Notre Dame at Balmoral, and a wide variety of street elements and amenities to West End streets.

Gloria was one of the driving forces behind Winnipeg hosting the International Downtown Association annual conference in Winnipeg in 2017. The conference brought close to 700 delegates from

BIZ groups from around the globe to share and exchange ideas on building urban excellence.

Gloria tells us that she will be working with her husband Barry as a consultant but also enjoying semi-retirement. I also expect she will be putting in extra shifts as a proud new grandmother.

On behalf of all of us who celebrate the diversity and energy of the West End, I thank Gloria for her advocacy, her unflagging spirit and her friendship. I ask my colleagues to join me in recognizing a true West End legend, Gloria Cardwell-Hoeppner.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Morris.

**Mr. Martin:** Madam Speaker, I seek leave to have the names of the Pembina Valley Twisters organization included with my member statement?

**Madam Speaker:** Is there leave to include those names in Hansard? *[Agreed]*

*2018-2019 Provincial MMJHL Champions – Players: Braeden Beernaerts, Jordan Blatz, Bentley Brandt, Elijah Carels, Dylan Dacquay, Tristan Day, Emery Falk, Quade Froese, Martin Gagnon, Jeremie Goderis, Nick Hatley, Brendan Keck, Jordan Keck, Eric Klassen, Mark Klassen, Travis Klassen, Braydon Klippenstein, Tyler Livingston, Micah Martin, T.J. Matuszewski, Ralph Penner, Travis Penner, Kevin Peters, Tyler Reiner, Wyatt Sabourin, Sven Schefer, James Van De Velde, Nico Vigier, Owen Wiebe, Derek Wood. Assistant Coaches: Matt Dyck, Mike Gilmore. Head Coach: Ryan Dyck.*

#### **Teulon's 100th Anniversary**

**Hon. Ralph Eichler (Minister of Agriculture):** The town of Teulon, commonly referred to as the Gateway to the Interlake, is celebrating 100 years. This vibrant community is excited to celebrate this important milestone throughout this year, but especially during the centennial celebrations taking place from June 27th to July the 1st.

Teulon was founded in 1919 as a settlement for immigrant farmers by Charles C. Castle, and was fondly named after his wife's maiden name of Teulon. Teulon soon became a village, then became a town in 1997. Surrounded by a wide variety of tourist and general interest attractions, Teulon is located in the middle of it all.

The town has many special events that attract visitors from near and far, and the upcoming centennial celebrations will certainly not disappoint.

A centennial cookbook will be available to help celebrate Teulon's centennial year. There'll also be entertainment and refreshments for all ages, including a grand fireworks display.

With many fun-filled days ahead you can marvel at the visual display, Teulon Through the Years, or participate in old-time dance, a golf tournament, games, wagon rides, pancake breakfast and the celebration parade, to mention only a few. That day's events will come to a close with a much anticipated concert featuring Manitoba's own Doc Walker.

Madam Speaker, it takes many people to see events of this importance come to completion, some of which are with us today. I would like to—like them to stand and be recognized. I extend my gratitude and appreciation for all their hard work and effort.

Please join me in congratulating this friendly, vibrant community as they celebrate this very important milestone.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Minister of Agriculture.

**Mr. Eichler:** Madam Speaker, I ask leave that their names be recorded in Hansard.

**Madam Speaker:** Is there leave to include those names in Hansard? *[Agreed]*

*Sharon Jack, Jan Lambourne, Mike Ledarney*

#### **Introduction of Guests**

**Madam Speaker:** Prior to oral questions, there are some guests in the gallery that I would like to introduce to you.

We have seated in the public gallery some guests of the honourable member for Lac du Bonnet (Mr. Ewasko). We have Gordon Stelmack, Eleanor Stelmack, Gary Rollins, Arlene Rollins, Paul Chapman, Rudie Friesen, Esther Friesen and Lucie Friesen.

Also in the public gallery from Tech-Voc High school we have 10 grade 12 students under the direction of Jeff Anderson, and this group is located in the constituency of the honourable member for Minto (Mr. Swan).

On behalf of all honourable members here, we welcome all of you to the Manitoba Legislature.

## ORAL QUESTIONS

### Concordia Hospital ER Timeline for Closure

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** Madam Speaker, it's clear that this Pallister government has no idea how to solve the chaos in the health-care system that they caused.

Now, the Pallister government spent some \$100,000 on a consultant who told them that no one is ready to close the emergency room at Concordia, and yet, inexplicably, they decided to announce that they still intend to close that emergency room by the end of June. But we know that no one is ready for this closure of Concordia. The front-line staff who work there are not ready. The Winnipeg Regional Health Authority is not ready and, of course, the consultant that they paid agrees that no one is ready for this closure to happen.

So it's more chaos, more confusion coming from this minister and this Premier (Mr. Pallister) and this government, who are certainly not getting the job done when it comes to health care, Madam Speaker.

Will the minister tell the House if Concordia emergency room will, in fact, close this June?

**Hon. Cameron Friesen (Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living):** The member is inaccurate. Actually, the independent external expert that he's referring to was able to share with Manitobans, and we disclosed that to Manitobans, that the plan for transformation of the health-care system is the right plan for Manitoba, and what he originally—and what he additionally said is that, when it came to the transition of emergency department changes to urgent care, that we should proceed, and we are proceeding according to that advice that we received.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a supplementary question.

### Concordia and Seven Oaks Hospitals Request to Retain ER Services

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** Well, I think the tepid applause from the other side indicates that that answer simply makes no sense. The answer doesn't make any sense when the minister stands up and says: Our plan is working; that's why we're having second thoughts.

\* (13:50)

Again, they admit that they have made mistakes. They admit that they do not know how many doctors or lab technicians are working in the Winnipeg health region, and yet somehow even though there's all this uncertainty, the one thing that they're absolutely certain about is that they must close the emergency room at Concordia this June, no matter what. It defies common sense and, most importantly, it is not in keeping with the best interests of patients and families across our province, who need good-quality health care close to home.

So will the minister please announce today that his plan, which has been failing the people for some two years now, was, in fact, a mistake and that they are now going to commit to keeping the emergency rooms at Concordia and Seven Oaks open?

**Hon. Cameron Friesen (Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living):** Well, the leader of the opposition and I agree that good-quality health care is important for Manitobans. What he does not disclose is that for years and years in this province under the NDP, Manitobans could not rely on that good-quality health care. He knows he is speaking of the emergency rooms that listed some of the longest wait times in all of Canada year after year.

So, when that member says go back, let us be very clear as Manitobans what he's saying. He's going—saying go back to the longest wait times in Canada when it came to emergency departments.

Our government says Manitobans do not want to go back. They want to go forward on a path to better health care sooner.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a final supplementary.

**Mr. Kinew:** It's like a maestro over here just conducting things on the opposite side of the Chamber, Madam Speaker.

Now, it would be funny—[interjection]

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** —if the issue of health care was not so important. It really is a life-and-death issue when it comes to the people of Manitoba.

The problem that this minister have—has is that the nurses in Manitoba have put their concerns in black and white, and what they said, a nurse with more than 30 years experience said, is that the health-care system in Manitoba is worse than it's ever been. Of course, we know that's confirmed by

statistics from the Winnipeg Regional Health Authority, which says that emergency room wait times, month over month and year over year, are increasing; that the Canadian institute of health information has said that surgery wait times are increasing; and, of course, as the nurses themselves say, that mandatory overtime is at historic levels. All of these point to the flaws in this minister and this Premier's (Mr. Pallister) plan.

Will they please reverse course and announce that the emergency rooms will, in fact, stay open?

**Mr. Friesen:** Madam Speaker, I welcome an opportunity to correct the record. The member is wrong. Actually, a recent CIHI study clearly showed that where every jurisdiction in Canada is experiencing higher wait times, Manitoba was the only province to buck that trend with lower overall wait times. It is clear that this is the right path for Manitoba.

However, I will share with that member, just last week I was speaking to a nurse who said, thank you for having the courage as a government to act to strengthen the health-care system—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Friesen:** —to make it better for not only patients, she said, but also for those who work in the system.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a new question.

#### **Health-Care Reform Nurse Staffing Levels**

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** Well, there he goes again, misrepresenting nurses in Manitoba.

The letter that I referred to earlier which said that the health-care—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** —system in Manitoba is worse than it's ever been for the past 30 years, that letter was penned by the organization that represents all nurses in Manitoba because of the blatant misrepresentations that this government, this minister and this Premier has made about the situations in our hospitals and in our emergency rooms.

What's more, we know that this minister and this Premier have presided over the cut of some

100 nursing jobs, just in Winnipeg, since they announced this failing plan for health care.

So I would repeat the question that we were trying to get the bottom of last week, Madam Speaker: Why did this government fire 100 nurses in Winnipeg?

**Hon. Cameron Friesen (Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living):** Madam Speaker, just because the member repeats it does not make it any more true.

I would refer that member to the information he himself disclosed last week. The information he showed on the record last week showed an overall increase in the number of nurses of 78 from year to year.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a supplementary question.

**Mr. Kinew:** You know, I got a lot of sympathy for this government that has to spend the whole weekend doing mental calisthenics to try and justify this terrible failure of a health-care plan that they brought into Manitoba, but the facts are these: in April of 2017 there were 5,379 nurses in Winnipeg; in April 2019 there are only 5,282 nurses in the city of Winnipeg. Ipso facto, they've cut 100 nursing jobs in Winnipeg. Again—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Kinew:** —it's simple arithmetic. Again, 5,400 minus 5,300 is 100 nursing positions that we've lost in Winnipeg.

Will the Premier and his minister simply commit today to rehiring those 100 nurses?

**Mr. Friesen:** I thank the member for his display of mathematics. Here's three more numbers for him: 2,824 in 2017; 2,902 in 2018: an increase of 78 nurses.

**Some Honourable Members:** Oh, oh.

**Madam Speaker:** I just want to remind everybody that we have a lot of guests in the gallery, please, and I think they'd like to hear the questions and answers that are being asked.

The honourable Leader of the Official Opposition, on a final supplementary.

**Mr. Kinew:** Okay, well I'll lend my abacus to the Health Minister later, but for the time being let's just all agree that they fired 100 nurses in the city of Winnipeg.



Furthermore, let's agree with the Winnipeg Regional Health Authority that says that emergency room wait times are increasing month after month and, of course, year over year.

And, finally, let's agree with the Canadian Institute for Health Information, which tells us that surgeries for hips and knees are increasing to ever record lengths under this government.

And, finally, let us also agree that surgeries for hearts in Winnipeg are being cancelled at historic levels.

If we agree with all of those prepositions, the only conclusion that we can arrive at, Madam Speaker, is that this government's plan for health care is failing. They need to reverse course; better yet, clear the way for a new government that can fix the health-care system, but, please, at least stop the damage and announce that the emergency rooms at Seven Oaks and Concordia hospitals will remain open.

**Mr. Friesen:** The member for the—the leader of the opposition has one message, and his message is go back. His message is go back to the past. Go back to the same tried and failed techniques—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Friesen:** —of the NDP, who had the highest cost health-care system in Canada and yet a system with some of the worst results.

We will continue to make the good investments in the health-care system like \$3.2 million just last month for an additional 30 nurses at St. Boniface Hospital and Health Sciences Centre, nurses who are on ward, who are dedicated to the—patient care and their profession every single day.

We'll continue to make the investments. We'll continue to put Manitobans first. They'll continue to make the same old excuses.

### Introduction of Guests

**Madam Speaker:** Prior to moving on with oral questions, we have some further guests in the gallery that I would like to introduce to you.

We have 15 students from grades 7 to 9 from Rock Lake School with their teacher, Mr. Rempel, and these students are from the constituency of the Minister of Justice (Mr. Cullen).

On behalf of all members, we welcome them here to the Manitoba Legislature.

\* \* \*

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable leader—or the honourable—

**Some Honourable Members:** Oh, oh.

\*(14:00)

**An Honourable Member:** Wab's sweatin'

**Madam Speaker:** And the Speaker is standing.

### Methamphetamine Addiction Government Strategy Request

**Ms. Nahanni Fontaine (St. Johns):** A freedom of information request, which I table for you today, shows that from January 1st to March 31st of this year, Brandon has distributed over 80,000 needles for harm reduction.

In 2018 the total number of needles distributed was close to 188,000 in a community of 50,000 people. In three months alone, Brandon has distributed almost half of the total needles in 2018. This shows the severity of the meth crisis that we—is presently gripping our province.

When will the Premier (Mr. Pallister) develop a plan and a strategy to effectively and comprehensively deal with the meth crisis?

**Hon. Cameron Friesen (Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living):** Well, I think that the member's own words would demonstrate that the government is dealing with the increase of methamphetamine use in our communities. We know that harm mitigation strategies continue to be part of the approach, and so, as she says, as the activities around the use of meth continue, so have the government's and the regional health authority's and public health's response in the way of creating the ability to make more resources available, just as she said in her question.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for St. Johns, on a supplementary question.

**Ms. Fontaine:** Over the weekend Winnipeg saw its 18th homicide. The young woman, Shaylnne Hunter, is, actually, already an MMIWG family member that the member for Point Douglas (Mrs. Smith) and myself have been working with their family for many, many years. She lost her life on the weekend. I had the opportunity to attend the vigil yesterday,

and it is utter devastation what is taking place in our communities.

The Winnipeg Police Service have attempted time and time again to show that there is a direct correlation between crime and the current meth crisis.

I ask the Premier (Mr. Pallister), I ask the ministers: What are they going to do to honour the life of Shaylnne Hunter and ensure that there are no more Shaylnne Hunters in Manitoba?

**Hon. Cliff Cullen (Minister of Justice and Attorney General):** Clearly, we take issues around public safety very seriously. I will say our—certainly, our thoughts are with the family of those that certainly lost their lives over the weekend.

I will say we had an announcement just on Thursday. We had police forces across our province gathered together. We are investing \$2.7 million in a public safety and policing strategy here in Manitoba. The focus of that strategy is to gather information and then more 'collaboraty'—collaboratively, as a province and as police forces, work together to get rid of the illicit drug trade here in Manitoba and protect Manitobans.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for St. Johns, on a final supplementary.

**Ms. Fontaine:** We need immediate, concrete solutions before Manitobans who are in the clutches of the meth addiction turn to crime to fuel their addiction. But, sadly, we have seen few if anything from this Premier and his ministers.

Instead, the Premier throws reports on the ground, counts money spent under a previous government, neglects to develop an action plan and ignores the VIRGO recommendations.

We know the Premier doesn't get along with others, but when these poor relationships mean that millions of dollars are left on the table, it's a wasted opportunity.

What will the Premier and his ministers do to protect Manitobans who are in the clutches of the meth addiction today? When will they develop a plan and a strategy to deal with this issue?

**Mr. Cullen:** Well, Madam Speaker, the member opposite is completely wrong.

Our government takes the meth situation very seriously. We know it's impacting a number of communities, certainly a number of families across

our province. We've set aside \$2.3 million to deal with the illicit drug strategy. We're working across government. Minister of Health has put a number of initiatives in place in terms of dealing with those that are addicted by meth. Certainly, our view as a government is to try to get meth out of the hands of the users, where the NDP is prescribing a method to actually allow users more access to meth.

We don't think that's a proper solution for Manitobans. We're interested in protecting Manitobans. *[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order, please.

### **Lifeflight Air Ambulance Request Not to Privatize**

**Ms. Amanda Lathlin (The Pas):** It has been three years of the North going unnoticed and bearing the repercussions of this government's cuts. In three years this minister has cancelled clinics in The Pas and Thompson, made deep cuts in the Northern Patient Transportation Program and closed a 'obstetrics'—excuse me—obstetrics clinic in Flin Flon, forcing expectant mothers to leave their communities, and is pursuing to plan to privatize Lifeflight. This doesn't sound like a government that has invested in the North.

Will the minister stop 'dismantling' northern health care and back off their plan to privatize Lifeflight?

**Hon. Cameron Friesen (Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living):** Madam Speaker, that member knows that when it comes to obstetrics at Flin Flon, that it was the vice—it was the advice of clinical leaders, nurse experts, obstetricians and clinical planners that said it was no longer safe to deliver that service, and on that—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Friesen:** —basis—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Friesen:** And on that basis the decision was taken to suspend those services.

And that member also knows, as they continue to heckle on that side, that the list of NDP closures permanently of obstetrics include: Hunter Memorial Hospital in Teulon; Pine Falls hospital; Lakeshore Hospital in Ashern; Hamiota Health Centre; Lorne Hospital; Ste. Rose General Hospital; and many more that time does not give me the opportunity to list.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for The Pas, on a supplementary question.

### Northern Health Care Funding and Capital Projects

**Ms. Amanda Lathlin (The Pas):** This minister continues to put timely access to essential health-care services further out of reach for northern Manitobans.

Last week we learned that this minister cut \$104 million in health-care capital last year alone. The minister could have used this money to build a primary care clinic in The Pas—\$5.3 million—and Thompson, at \$9 million, and still had money left for other critically needed care in the North. But, instead, he chose not to; another broken promise.

Why does this government care so little about northern Manitobans' health care?

**Hon. Cameron Friesen (Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living):** Madam Speaker, it must be an awkward question for the member to try to pose when she understands that we just recently got back from officially opening the new \$27-million new emergency department in Flin Flon.

There isn't time to list in this response the—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Friesen:** —many capital projects that this government is currently undertaking in the North across the jurisdiction and even in the very neighbourhood that that member represents.

Madam Speaker, we are making good investments in the North, we're making good investments in health care, and I would only like more time to be able to list some of the ways in which we're making those investments at this very time.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for The Pas, on a final supplementary.

**Ms. Lathlin:** The minister continues to put profits before care for those in the North, and sadly, this trend of underinvesting in health care isn't new.

Last year the minister underspent a combined \$340 million on health-care operating and capital costs last year alone, and now this year he cut \$120 million from the budget.

Northerners already—are already feeling the effects of this government's past cuts, and now many are afraid of what's to come.

When will the minister wake up and realize his cuts and closures are hurting our northern health-care system and commit to adequately funding health care in the North?

**Mr. Friesen:** It was only last Friday that the Premier (Mr. Pallister) and I were able to announce new emergency medical service investments across Canada as part of Budget 2019. These will include paramedics who—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Friesen:** —will practice in the North.

So in direct response to her question—I would, though, correct the member. She knows full well that health spending under this government is up \$414 million more than an NDP government ever invested in health care. *[interjection]*

\* (14:10)

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

### Climate and Green Plan Government Record

**Mr. Dougald Lamont (Leader of the Second Opposition):** There have been glowing—growing climate strikes around the world as young people call for action on climate change. It's been over a year and a half since this government threw down their off-green plan, a remarkable document, not least because the Premier claimed to be working on 76 pages of it when it's only 64 pages long.

It would appear he's actually only working on one of those pages: the blank one behind the cover. Because when it comes to action, this government has barely moved at all.

We were told by experts at committee that the Heritage Trust needed to be 10 times as large to be effective, and this government is actually only investing one five-hundredth of that amount.

When the government was asked about reduction targets for greenhouse gases, they said they're working on it. Yet it's been 200 days since their legislation received royal assent and not a word from the government on how they're actually going to do it.

When is this government releasing its greenhouse gas reduction goals, as they legislated themselves to do?

**Hon. Rochelle Squires (Minister of Sustainable Development):** I'm very pleased that our expert advisory council has been working very diligently to provide that information that that member has asked for, and, of course, our government is continuing on the—our initiatives to reduce greenhouse gases in the province of Manitoba in a meaningful way and setting targets that we can achieve, unlike members opposite who set targets and never achieved them.

And this question coming from a member who supports a rising, escalating carbon tax—no ceiling on that carbon tax is what this member opposite is advocating for. Our government is committed to investing—or, protecting the environment and protecting the economy. *[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order. Order.

The honourable Leader of the Second Opposition, on a supplementary question.

**Mr. Lamont:** It's worth repeating that the PC green plan has no timelines or targets.

The Premier (Mr. Pallister) stomped his feet, decided to challenge the carbon tax in court, despite flowing—knowing full well that he has no case. His plan, which he appears to have abandoned, relied on a carbon tax for half of its emission reductions because—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Lamont:** —even his own government knew the best way to reduce emissions is to put a price on pollution, and harming our environment should never be free.

Every PC MLA once voted for a carbon price even higher than we—what we have right now.

Will the Premier stop with the finger pointing and get on with implementing any of the other portions of his half-baked green plan, or is it what we all thought: all talk?

**Ms. Squires:** While this member continues to advocate for an escalating carbon price without any consideration for growing the Manitoba economy, our government is focused on getting results.

We are the government that shut down the coal-fired electricity in the province of Manitoba,

reducing many carbon emission reductions. We've reduced the fleet of government vehicles in the province of Manitoba—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Ms. Squires:** —to achieve meaningful emissions, and we have also invested and are moving forward to protect Manitoba Hydro so that we can not only continue to achieve those meaningful emissions reductions here in the province of Manitoba but help other jurisdictions reduce their reliance on coal while reducing their carbon footprint.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable Leader of the Second Opposition, on a final supplementary.

**Mr. Lamont:** The Pallister government's decision to tear up their green plan and walk away from the negotiating table in a huff was the opposite of leadership.

Manitoba Liberals have made it clear: we will take back control of the plan that works for Manitoba.

And at a critical juncture on an issue that is critical to the economy of our province, to our country and to the health of the planet, the Premier abandoned his post. He surrendered control to Ottawa, and we've seen other PC premiers do the same in lockstep.

The Pallister government dismantled Power Smart, which actually saw energy-use reductions, and replaced it with a new Crown corporation that has done nothing in the last year and has no staff. They promised organics diversion and an increased biodiesel mandate, which this government appears to have forgotten about. They've promised wetland restoration and electric buses, yet they've cut funding to municipalities and Sustainable Development.

Rather than getting anything done for Manitobans—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Lamont:** —will the Premier admit his only interest is in getting re-elected?

**Ms. Squires:** Madam Speaker, this member has a lot of audacity to talk about carbon emission reductions when, if he wanted to do something of benefit for the Manitoba carbon footprint and reducing our footprint, he would pick up the phone and call his federal cousins, who are right now interfering with the Manitoba-Minnesota transmission line.

They're interfering with that. That line has the ability to take the equivalent of 25,000 cars off the road. That plan—that transmission line has the opportunity to displace very carbon-intense heating and energy sources south of the border, and here we have a Liberal government who is interfering with that and not allowing that project to go through.

If he wants to do something for the environment, I suggest he pick up the phone and call Ottawa.

#### **Northern Job Losses Use of Reserve Funds**

**Mr. Tom Lindsey (Flin Flon):** Last month Manitoba experienced the biggest jump in employment insurance claims in all of Canada. Part of this job loss, of course, is in the North. The Pallister government knows this. Their own department's predicted 1,500 job losses in northern Manitoba, yet the minister refuses to use any of the tools that are available.

He froze the Communities Economic Development Fund, refuses to use the Mining Community Reserve Fund to help mining communities.

Why won't this government lift a finger to help northern Manitoba?

**Hon. Scott Fielding (Minister of Finance):** This government is extremely proud of the fact that we've created over 14,000 new jobs in the province of Manitoba. We're also leading the nation in private sector capital investment, so we know businesses are coming to Manitoba because they see it as a viable alternative because of some of the work of getting the fundamentals of government right.

We also have one of the lowest unemployment here in the province of Manitoba.

Thank you, Madam Speaker.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Flin Flon, on a supplementary question.

**Mr. Lindsey:** The mining reserve fund was established nearly 50 years ago. Conservative governments and NDP governments have all agreed that the mining reserve fund exists to help mining communities facing mining disruption.

It's only this Pallister government that disagrees. They won't release funds that have been set aside specifically to help these communities.

When will this Pallister government put forward funding and a plan to support northern people,

including releasing funds from the Mining Community Reserve Fund?

**Hon. Cameron Friesen (Acting Minister of Growth, Enterprise and Trade):** Madam Speaker, our government continues to work actively with First Nations communities, northern communities and the federal government to implement a consultation in Manitoba that demonstrates a balanced approach when it comes to mineral development.

That member also knows that he has a conundrum. He stands and argues for the mining reserve fund at the same time that he has a party that says, when it comes to mineral exploration, you should leave it in the ground.

I wonder for that member how that message is resonating back home.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Flin Flon, on a final supplementary.

**Mr. Lindsey:** You know, Madam Speaker, this government can continue to stand up and put whatever misinformation they want on the record, but the community mining reserve fund is there to help mining communities that are in trouble.

This government has said repeatedly, well, there's no funds there, but I'll table a FIPPA response that shows that each and every year over the last two years, the fund has in fact remained over \$10 million.

At the same time, it's also paid out some money for exploration, as it's intended to do. But, when mining communities are in trouble and need funds, this government refuses to release those funds.

So, never mind paying fast and loose with the facts—

**Madam Speaker:** The member's time has expired.

**Mr. Friesen:** Well, while I didn't hear a question, I could say, Madam Speaker, that the government, of course, is interested in connecting future funding for mineral exploration to priorities that we've outlined in our Manitoba economic growth plan, our Look North initiatives and our implementation of mineral development protocols.

\* (14:20)

Madam Speaker, this minister, we know, has also established a liaison committee for mining and mineral exploration. *[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Friesen:** When the NDP did nothing for years and years to create conditions that would attract new investment, we are doing that. We are working collaboratively with the North and northerners to create a climate for investment and stimulate the northern economy.

**Madam Speaker:** We still have lots of guests in the gallery. We've got students in the gallery.

And I'm going to call the member for Point Douglas (Mrs. Smith) and the Minister for Infrastructure (Mr. Schuler) to order. There's been an unacceptable amount of heckling coming from both of them, and I would ask for their co-operation, please.

### **PST Reduction PC Election Promise**

**Mr. James Teitsma (Radisson):** Manitobans remember. Manitobans remember when the NDP went to their doors, knocked on their doors and made a solemn promise not to raise taxes. And the NDP—Manitobans—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Teitsma:** —remember very clearly when those same NDP—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Teitsma:** —raised those taxes, jacked up the PST to 8 per cent.

And Manitobans remember when we went to the doors and when we promised we were going to drop the PST to 7 per cent. On July 1st, we are keeping that promise.

So, Madam Speaker, can the Minister of Finance please tell this House how Manitobans will benefit from the absence of a government that, unlike the NDP—

**Some Honourable Members:** Oh, oh.

**Madam Speaker:** The member's time has expired.

And I would indicate that I never even was able to hear that because of the amount of heckling that was on the floor. So I would ask for everybody's co-operation, please, because if I'm not hearing it, then I cannot, in fact, tell whether or not we are following the rules.

So I would ask for everybody's co-operation, please. This is getting a little bit out of hand,

especially when we have so many guests in the gallery.

**Hon. Scott Fielding (Minister of Finance):** Thank the member for the question.

Our government ran on a commitment to decrease the PST by one point in our first term, Madam Speaker, and that's to put more money on the kitchen table instead of the Cabinet table.

Unlike the NDP government, we're making life more affordable for Manitobans. The PST is 'reducing' from 8 to 7 per cent, which represents the biggest tax cut in Manitoba's history.

We know the track record of the NDP. Where the NDP broke the trust of Manitobans, we're going to repair that trust and live up to our commitments.

### **Methamphetamine Addiction Services Plan for Northern Communities**

**Ms. Judy Klassen (Kewatinook):** There are simply not enough resources to combat the meth crisis, whether you are in an isolated community up north to down south here in Winnipeg. This government needs to begin actively letting the public know as to what—as to how they're going to combat this crisis.

Can the minister tell us what they are doing or what they plan to do with the meth crisis in the North that we are facing, and please do not restate obvious facts. Manitobans need real answers, and they need them now.

**Hon. Cliff Cullen (Minister of Justice and Attorney General):** I will certainly be more than happy to put on some of the obvious facts that we're doing here: obviously, working across government to deal with the meth situation that is impacting so many Manitoba families.

I do want to say from the outset, though, I am very impressed by the police forces across Manitoba in terms of the work they're doing in stopping the flow of meth and other illicit drugs across Manitoba. I don't think we're—give enough credit to the police officers, the seizures they've made in various communities across Manitoba, including northern Manitoba. They're doing everything they can to keep meth out of the hands of Manitobans. And we've invested \$2.3 million to help them do just that.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Kewatinook, on a supplementary question.

**Ms. Klassen:** In one of my communities, the leadership managed to reduce the amount of illicit

drugs from entering the First Nation. But our First Nations safety officers could not relax very long, as another issue arose: the addicts then began trying to walk across thin ice in hopes of reaching nearby communities for their supply.

Dry-out centres are few and far between for many communities in the North.

What is the minister doing to ensure that when addicts are trying to quit that they have the resources available to them across the province? And please know that a warm cup of coffee is a poor excuse of an answer.

**Mr. Cullen:** We do recognize that families and communities are being impacted by illicit drugs. That's why we've set aside \$2.3 million for that.

We've also, in terms of rural Manitoba, in this year's budget we've allocated additional funding for up to 29 RCMP officers for rural Manitoba. We think that's important.

We've also designated more money for communities and how communities deal with illicit drug trade. So in terms of the hub model, the community mobilizations, we've allocated more money to communities for that.

We're—continue to train First Nations safety officers. More safety officers will be in the field and we will continue to invest in resources to stop the illicit drug trade here in Manitoba.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Kewatinook, on a final supplementary.

**Ms. Klassen:** The meth crisis has Manitobans terrified. They are scared for their safety, for the safety of their families and communities, and they're scared for their future.

Meth is stealing the future for thousands of Manitobans, and this government shrugs and says, well, it's complicated, and goes back to blaming everyone else.

Minister, everyone's exhausted from this battle.

When will this government actually implement a plan that doesn't involve firing people and shutting down ERs? When will this government make things better for all Manitobans?

**Mr. Cullen:** Well, Madam Speaker, we take the illicit drug trade—and certainly public safety is paramount for us. We're investing in the \$2.3 million to fight illicit drugs. We're putting money into

communities in terms of community mobilization. We've put in half a billion dollars for the HealthIM initiative to deal with mental health people up front.

And certainly, in terms of looking at Thompson, for instance, we recognize Thompson as a hub of northern Manitoba. It's also become the hub for crime. We've committed \$300,000 to work with the community of Thompson and the communities around Thompson to fight the issues around illicit drug trade.

Madam Speaker, we are doing a lot to enhance public safety here in Manitoba.

### **Fixed Election Date Government Position**

**Mr. Andrew Swan (Minto):** Madam Speaker, in 2016 the Premier (Mr. Pallister) told Manitobans that he would be, and I quote, adhering to the current fixed-election-day act requirement. And he didn't just say it; it was part of the platform of the PC party on page 32, ironically under the section entitled fairer elections.

But with this Premier planning more cuts to front-line services and the economy slowing, he finds the date set in law to be inconvenient. He wants to rig the game, break the law for his own benefit.

I know I won't get an answer from the Premier, so I'll ask the Minister of Justice: Why is the Premier planning an illegal election in breach of Manitoba's fixed-election-date laws?

**Hon. Cliff Cullen (Minister of Justice and Attorney General):** Well, Madam Speaker, I appreciate this question from the member opposite. I know the member is a lawyer, so he should probably be doing his diligence and actually go and read the legislation that currently exists.

And I don't know what the member is—why he's afraid of an election. Maybe the NDP, I recognize, they're not sure who's in the party, who's out of the party, who's going to run in the election, who's not going to run in the election. I realize they've got issues around that.

But, Madam Speaker, we certainly will be abiding by the rules of the law—of the land. We respect the rules of the land and we will be abiding by the legislation as it is written.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Minto on a supplementary question.

**Mr. Swan:** You know, we shouldn't be surprised that crime is out of control in Winnipeg and across Manitoba under this Minister of Justice. He can't even get his own Premier (Mr. Pallister) to follow the law.

The Premier's evasiveness and his unwillingness to give a straight answer makes it clear. They're maximizing their advantage by—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Swan:** —creating confusion, in or—it should be obvious, and I would let the Minister of Justice know the law is actually very clear. There is a set date for the next election: it is October 6th, 2020. But now they want—they see an advantage. They're willing to break the law and call it whenever they see fit.

Why is this Minister of Justice going to allow an illegal election in complete contravention to what his Premier and every single member of this PC promised in the last election campaign?

\* (14:30)

**Mr. Cullen:** I just want to reflect a little bit on what pictures we saw from the opposition and their antics over the weekend. Apparently, they were out appearing with a Soviet flag—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Cullen:** —and we—certainly, Madam Speaker, we know what the Soviet flag symbolizes: oppression, genocide. Clearly, the NDP are Soviet sympathizers.

We recognize where they're coming from, Madam Speaker. We're out there working on democracy, working on the best interests—*[interjection]*

**Madam Speaker:** Order.

**Mr. Cullen:** —of Manitoba.

Madam Speaker, if the opposition is ready for an integrity quiz, Manitobans are, too, and so are we.

**Madam Speaker:** The time for oral questions has expired.

The honourable member for Assiniboia, I believe?

**Hon. Steven Fletcher (Assiniboia):** Yes. On a matter of privilege, Madam Speaker.

## MATTER OF PRIVILEGE

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable member for Assiniboia, on a matter of privilege.

**Hon. Steven Fletcher (Assiniboia):** Two conditions need to be met for a matter of privilege.

This is my first opportunity to raise this in this House.

Last Wednesday, there was a reply to a written question on the Order Paper dealing with the documentation, timelines and required information about the sale of 255 Hamilton Ave.

In the documentation it is clear now, as it always has been, but the written answer provided by the minister contradicts earlier statements the minister has made in this place. And I am going to table the supporting documents in Hansard.

Madam Speaker, now, we're—we've become used to ministers contradicting themselves, but this—what this is—can we—you can pass those—just passing these tabled documents.

These—the contradiction here builds on a very important issue of transparency and accountability. Freedom of information requests have been received, and I'm tabling them now. It clearly shows the minister, who was then the minister of Families, knew about the transfer long before it was—it became public. It's his signatures on the letters.

The—but much of the content on these—in these letters has been redacted. So we don't know what the terms are on this government-to-government transfer—is. That is, how the Province was able to force the City to sell this land that's worth millions and is important to the community for \$1—\$1.

The minister has—now the Finance Minister—has deflected and misled this Chamber and obviously has directed the department to redact these—which, by the way, Madam Speaker, took 18 months to get a hold of. It should be 30 days.

In the documents I've tabled, there is a Bruce Oake Recovery Centre realty holding company, for-profit. There's also a not-for-profit Bruce Oake facility. But we cannot tell if the land has been transferred from Manitoba renewal corporation, who this has been conducted through, to the for-profit or the not-for-profit, or what safeguards are in place.



How are you going to deal with taxation? It's—since it's a government-to-government transfer, it should be transparent, public and accountable, and none of this—all these—all this information has been redacted in these letters.

So, Madam Speaker, combined with the fact that the sole shareholder of the for-profit realty company, it's also a major fundraiser for the PC Party of Manitoba.

So we really need to find out what is going on here, and we can't do it when the government redacts based on market—on, like, commercial issues or they—or just because they don't want people to know, and it's not a good reason. To redact, national security, maybe, but not for a government-to-government realty—

**Madam Speaker:** Order, please.

The member needs to be specific about the breach of privilege and not be getting further into debate of the issue.

So I would ask the member if he could specifically address how this particular issue is a breach of his privilege, and then I would ask the member that he will have to send up a motion with a seconder, as well.

**Mr. Fletcher:** Madam Speaker, the breach of privilege is the minister not providing this Chamber with correct information when knowingly saying things that he knows have been incorrect. The breach is we need information as MLAs to be able to properly hold the government to account, and the government is preventing that.

So I move, seconded by the member from Maples, that this matter be referred to the Auditor General, the Manitoba Ombudsman and the Conflict of Interest Commissioner.

**Madam Speaker:** Before recognizing any other members to speak, I would remind the House that remarks at this time by honourable members are limited to strictly relevant comments about whether the alleged matter of privilege has been raised at the earliest opportunity and whether a prima facie case has been established.

**Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Government House Leader):** Madam Speaker, on the two tests, the member opposite's first opportunity would've been Thursday to raise this issue. He did not. He also did not raise any specific way in which his privileges as

a member have been breached, so it fails on both tests.

**Madam Speaker:** On the matter of privilege raised by the honourable member for Assiniboia, I would like to inform the House that this is clearly a difference of the facts. Past Manitoba Speakers have ruled on several similar occasions that a dispute between two members as to allegations of fact does not constitute a breach of privilege.

O'Brien and Bosc advise, on page 145 of House of Commons Procedure and Practice, that if a question of privilege involves a disagreement between two or more members as to facts, the Speaker typically rules that such a dispute does not prevent members from fulfilling their parliamentary functions, nor does such a disagreement breach the collective privileges of the House.

Beauchesne's citation 31(1) advises that a dispute arising between two members as to allegations of facts does not fulfill the conditions of parliamentary privilege.

Joseph Maingot, on page 223 of the second edition of Parliamentary Privilege in Canada states: A dispute between two members about questions of facts said in a debate does not constitute a valid question of privilege because it is a matter of debate.

I would therefore rule that the honourable member does not have a prima facie case of privilege.

**Mr. Fletcher:** I challenge the Chair.

**Madam Speaker:** Does the member have support of three other members?

The ruling of the Chair has been challenged.

The question before the House is shall the ruling of the Chair be sustained.

**Some Honourable Members:** Agreed.

**Some Honourable Members:** No.

**Madam Speaker:** I hear a no.

#### Voice Vote

**Madam Speaker:** All those in favour please say yea.

**Some Honourable Members:** Yea.

**Madam Speaker:** All those opposed, please say nay.

**Some Honourable Members:** Nay.

**Madam Speaker:** In my opinion, the Yeas have it.

\* (14:40)

### Recorded Vote

**Mr. Fletcher:** Can we have a recorded vote?

**Madam Speaker:** Is there support for a recorded vote?

A recorded vote having been called, call in the members.

\* (15:40)

Order. The one hour provided for the ringing of the division bells has expired. I am therefore directing that the division bells be turned off and the House proceed to the vote.

The question before the House is shall the ruling of the Chair be sustained.

### Division

*A RECORDED VOTE was taken, the result being as follows:*

#### Yeas

*Allum, Altemeyer, Cox, Cullen, Eichler, Ewasko, Fletcher, Friesen, Gerrard, Goertzen, Graydon, Helwer, Isleifson, Johnson, Johnston, Lagassé, Lamoureux, Lathlin, Lindsey, Maloway, Marcelino (Tyndall Park), Martin, Mayer, Michaleski, Micklefield, Morley-Lecomte, Nesbitt, Piwniuk, Saran, Schuler, Smith (Southdale), Smook, Squires, Stefanson, Swan, Teitsma, Wharton, Wiebe, Wishart, Wowchuk, Yakimoski.*

#### Nays

**Clerk (Ms. Patricia Chaychuk):** Yeas 41, Nays 0.

**Madam Speaker:** The ruling of the Chair has been sustained.

### PETITIONS

#### Daylight Saving Time

**Mr. Cliff Graydon (Emerson):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

And the background for this petition is as follows:

The loss of sleep associated with the beginning of daylight saving time has serious consequences for physical and mental health and has been linked to increases in traffic accidents and workplace injuries.

(2) According to a Manitoba Public Insurance news release, collision data collected in 2014 showed that there was a 20 per cent increase in collisions on Manitoba roadways following the spring daylight savings time change when compared to all other Mondays in 2014.

(3) Daylight saving time is associated with a decrease in productivity the day after the clocks are turned forward with no corresponding increase in productivity when the clocks are turned back.

(4) There is no conclusive evidence that daylight saving time is effective in reducing energy consumption.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to amend The Official Time Act to abolish daylight savings time in Manitoba effective November 4th, 2019, resulting in Manitoba remaining on Central Standard Time throughout the year and in perpetuity.

And this petition has been signed by Dan Hiebert, Randy Hiebert, Craig Hiebert and many, many more fine Manitobans.

**Madam Speaker:** In accordance with our rule 133(6), when petitions are read, they are deemed to be received by the House.

#### Early Learning and Child-Care Programs

**Mr. James Allum (Fort Garry-Riverview):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) Early learning and child-care programs in Manitoba require increased funding to stabilize and support a system that is in jeopardy.

(2) Licensed, not-for-profit early learning and child-care programs have received no new operating funding in over three years, while the cost of living has continued to increase annually.

(3) High-quality licensed child care has a lasting, positive impact on children's development, is a fundamental need for Manitoba families and contributes to a strong economy.

(4) The financial viability of these programs is in jeopardy if they cannot meet the fiscal responsibility of achieving a balanced budget, as all operating expenses continue to increase.

(5) The workforce shortage of trained early childhood educators has continued to increase; quality child care is dependent on a workforce that is skilled and adequately remunerated.

(6) Accessible, affordable and quality early learning and child-care programs must be available to all children and families in Manitoba.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to increase funding for licensed, not-for-profit child-care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba, which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

And, Madam Speaker, this petition is signed by Amanda Teixeira, Daniel Teixeira, Pamela Falkenberg and many other Manitobans.

**Mr. Dougald Lamont (Leader of the Second Opposition):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

Early learning and child-care programs in Manitoba require increased funding to stabilize and support a system that is in jeopardy.

Licensed, not-for-profit early learning and child-care programs have received no new operating funding in over three years, while the cost of living has continued to increase annually.

(3) High-quality licensed child care has a lasting, positive impact on children's development, is a fundamental need for Manitoba families and contributes to a strong economy.

(4) The financial viability of these programs is in jeopardy if they cannot meet the fiscal responsibility of achieving a balanced budget, as all operating expenses continue to increase.

(5) The workforce shortage of trained early childhood educators has continued to increase; quality child care is dependent on a workforce that is skilled and adequately remunerated.

(6) Accessible, affordable and quality early learning and child-care programs must be available to all children and families in Manitoba.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to increase funding for licensed, not-for-profit child-care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba, which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

Signed Kathi Clegg, Alysia Lindal, Mandy Thorgilsson and many others.

**Mr. Rob Altemeyer (Wolseley):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) Early learning and child-care programs in Manitoba require increased funding to stabilize and support a system that is in jeopardy.

(2) Licensed, not-for-profit early learning and child-care programs have received no new operating funding in over three years, while the cost of living has continued to increase annually.

(3) High-quality licensed child care has a lasting, positive impact on children's development, is a fundamental need for Manitoba families and contributes to a strong economy.

The financial viability of these programs is in jeopardy if they cannot meet the fiscal responsibility of achieving a balanced budget, as all operating expenses continue to increase.

\* (15:50)

(5) The workforce shortage of trained early childhood educators has continued to increase; quality child care is dependent on a workforce that is skilled and adequately remunerated.

(6) Accessible, affordable and quality early learning and child-care programs must be available to all children and families in Manitoba.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to increase funding for licensed, not-for-profit child-care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba, which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

And this petition was signed by Marlena Wilde, Kelsey Fonseca, Debbie Buscemi and many, many other fine Manitobans.

**Ms. Amanda Lathlin (The Pas):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) Early learning and child-care programs in Manitoba require increased funding to stabilize and support a system that is in jeopardy.

(2) Licensed, not-for-profit early learning and child-care programs have received no new operating funding in over three years, while the cost of living has continued to increase annually.

(3) High-quality licensed child care has a lasting, positive impact on children's development, is a fundamental need for Manitoba families and contributes to a strong economy.

(4) The financial viability of these programs is in jeopardy if they cannot meet the fiscal responsibility of achieving a balanced budget, as all operating expenses continue to increase.

(5) The workforce shortage of trained early childhood educators has continued to increase; quality child care is dependent on a workforce that is skilled and adequately remunerated.

(6) Accessible, affordable and quality early learning and child-care programs must be available to all children and families in Manitoba.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to increase funding for licensed, not-for-profit child-care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba, which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

Madam Speaker, this petition has been signed by many, many Manitobans.

**Ms. Flor Marcelino (Logan):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) Early learning and child-care programs in Manitoba require increased funding to stabilize and support a system that is in jeopardy.

(2) Licensed, not-for-profit early learning and child-care programs have received no new funding—no new operating funding in over three years, while the cost of living has continued to increase annually.

(3) High-quality licensed child care has a lasting, positive impact on children's development, is a

fundamental need for Manitoba families and contributes to a strong economy.

(4) The financial viability of these programs is in jeopardy if they cannot meet the fiscal responsibility of achieving a balanced budget, as all operating expenses continue to increase.

(5) The workforce shortage of trained early childhood educators has continued to increase; quality child care is dependent on a workforce that is skilled and adequately remunerated.

(6) Accessible, affordable and quality early learning and child-care programs must be available to all children and families in Manitoba.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to increase funding for licensed, not-for-profit child-care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba, which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

Signed by many Manitobans.

Thank you.

**Mr. Ted Marcelino (Tyndall Park):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

And the background to this petition is as follows:

(1) Early learning and child-care programs in Manitoba require increased funding to stabilize and support a system that is in jeopardy.

(2) Licensed, not-for-profit early learning and child-care programs have received no new operating funding in over three years, while the cost of living has continued to increase annually.

(3) High-quality licensed child care has a lasting, positive impact on children's development, is a fundamental need for Manitoba families and contributes to a strong economy.

(4) The financial viability of these programs is in jeopardy if they cannot meet the fiscal responsibility of achieving a balanced budget, as all operating expenses continue to increase.

(5) The workforce shortage of trained early childhood educators has continued to increase; quality child care is dependent on a workforce that is skilled and adequately remunerated.

(6) Accessible, affordable and quality early learning and child-care programs must be available to all children and families in Manitoba.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to increase funding for licensed, not-for-profit child-care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba, which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

This petition was signed by Gloria Dato, Salve Bautista, Anthony Bautista and many, many more.

Thank you.

### **Tina Fontaine—Public Inquiry**

**Ms. Nahanni Fontaine (St. Johns):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

These are the reasons for this petition:

(1) Tina Fontaine was murdered at the age of 15 years, and her body was found in the Red River on August 17th, 2014.

(2) Tina Fontaine was robbed of her loving family and the Anishinabe community of Sagkeeng First Nation.

(3) Tina Fontaine was failed by multiple systems which did not protect her as they intervened in her life.

(4) Tina Fontaine was further failed by systems meant to seek and pursue justice for her murder.

(5) Tina Fontaine's murder galvanized Canada on the issue of missing and murdered indigenous women and girls, MMIWG, as she quickly became our collective daughter and the symbol of MMIWG across Canada.

(6) Manitoba has failed to fully implement the recommendations of numerous reports and recommendations meant to improve and protect the lives of indigenous peoples and children, including the Manitoba Aboriginal Justice Inquiry, the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, the Phoenix Sinclair inquiry.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

(1) To urge the Premier of Manitoba and the Minister of Justice to immediately call a public

inquiry into the systems that had a role in the life and death of Tina Fontaine, as well as the function of the administration of justice after her death.

\*(16:00)

(2) To urge that the terms of reference of a public inquiry be developed jointly with the caregivers of Tina Fontaine and/or the agent appointed by them.

Signed by James Taylor, Michael Ryan Potts, Melvin Walker and many more Manitobans.

### **Early Learning and Child-Care Programs**

**Mr. Andrew Swan (Minto):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) Early learning and child-care programs in Manitoba require increased funding to stabilize and support a system that is in jeopardy.

(2) Licensed, not-for-profit early learning and child-care programs have received no new operating funding in over three years, while the cost of living has continued to increase annually.

(3) High-quality licensed child care has a lasting, positive impact on children's development, is a fundamental need for Manitoba families and contributes to a strong economy.

(4) The financial viability of these programs is in jeopardy if they cannot meet the fiscal responsibility of achieving a balanced budget, as all operating expenses continue to increase.

(5) The workforce shortage of trained early childhood educators has continued to increase; quality child care is dependent on a workforce that is skilled and adequately remunerated.

(6) Accessible, affordable and quality early learning and child-care programs must be available to all children and families in Manitoba.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to increase funding for licensed, not-for-profit child-care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba, which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

And, Madam Speaker, this petition is signed by Nicole Ross, Marnie Vielfaure, Paul Vielfaure and many other Manitobans.

**Mr. Tom Lindsey (Flin Flon):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) Early learning and child-care programs in Manitoba require increased funding to stabilize and support a system that is in jeopardy.

(2) Licensed, not-for-profit early learning and child-care programs have received no new operating funding in over three years, while the cost of living has continued to increase annually.

(3) High-quality licensed child care has a lasting, positive impact on children's development, is a fundamental need for Manitoba families and contributes to a strong economy.

(4) The financial viability of these programs is in jeopardy if they cannot meet the fiscal responsibility of achieving a balanced budget, as all operating expenses continue to increase.

(5) The workforce shortage of trained early childhood educators has continued to increase; quality child care is dependent on a workforce that is skilled and adequately remunerated—remunerated, sorry.

(6) Accessible, affordable and quality early learning and child-care programs must be available to all children and families in Manitoba.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to increase funding for licensed, not-for-profit child-care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba, which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

And, Madam Speaker, this petition is signed by David Whyte, Ryan Vermett, Steven Russell and many other Manitobans.

### **Quality Health Care**

**Mr. Matt Wiebe (Concordia):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

And the background to the petition is as follows:

(1) The provincial government's program of cuts and restructuring in health care have had serious negative consequences, reduced both access to and quality of care for patients, increased wait times, exasperated the 'nursing'—nursing shortage and significantly increased workload and the reliance on overtime from nurses and other health-care professionals.

(2) Further cuts and consolidation are opposed by a majority of Manitobans and will only further reduce access to health-care services.

(3) The provincial government had rushed through these cuts and changes, and failed to adequately consult nurses and other health-care professionals who provide front-line patient care.

(4) Ongoing cuts and changes appear to be more about saving money than improving health care.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

(1) To urge the provincial government to reverse cuts and closures that negatively impact patients' ability to access timely, quality health care.

(2) To urge the provincial government to make real investments in Manitoba's public health-care system that will improve the timeliness and quality of care for patients by increasing the number of beds across the system and recruiting and retaining an adequate number of nurses and other health-care professionals to meet Manitoba's needs.

And this petition is signed by many Manitobans.

### **Early Learning and Child-Care Programs**

**Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) Early learning and child-care programs in Manitoba require increased funding to stabilize and support a system that is in jeopardy.

(2) Licensed, not-for-profit early learning and child-care programs have received no new operating funding in over three years, while the cost of living has continued to increase annually.

(3) High-quality licensed child care has a lasting, positive impact on children's development, is a fundamental need for Manitoba families and contributes to a strong economy.

(4) The financial viability of these programs is in jeopardy if they cannot meet the fiscal responsibility of achieving a balanced budget, as all operating expenses continue to increase.

(5) The workforce shortage of trained early childhood educators has continued to increase; quality child care is dependent on a workforce that is skilled and adequately remunerated.

Accessible, affordable and quality early learning and child-care programs must be available to all children and families in Manitoba.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to increase funding for licensed, not-for-profit child-care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba, which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce.

Signed by Jacobs Oshoneye, Ajibola Bolaosebikan and Olapeju Oshoneye and many others.

**Madam Speaker:** Grievances?

## ORDERS OF THE DAY GOVERNMENT BUSINESS

### House Business

**Hon. Kelvin Goertzen (Government House Leader):** On House business, I'd like to announce the Standing Committee on Social and Economic Development will meet on Wednesday, May 29th, 2019, at 6 p.m., to consider Bill 32, An Act concerning the Leasing of 800 Adele Avenue, Winnipeg.

\* (16:10)

**Madam Speaker:** It has been announced that the Standing Committee on Social and Economic Development will meet on Wednesday, May 29th, 2019, at 6 p.m., to consider Bill 32, An Act concerning the Leasing of 800 Adele Avenue, Winnipeg.

\* \* \*

**Mr. Goertzen:** Madam Speaker, could you please call for debate on second readings, Bill 22, Bill 24 and Bill 25.

**Madam Speaker:** It has been announced that the House will resume debate on second readings of bills 22, 24 and 25.

## DEBATE ON SECOND READINGS

### Bill 22—The Business Registration, Supervision and Ownership Transparency Act (Various Acts Amended)

**Madam Speaker:** Resuming debate, then, on Bill 22 on the proposed motion of the honourable Minister of Growth, Enterprise and Trade (Mr. Pedersen), Bill 22, The Business Registration, Supervision and Ownership Transparency Act (Various Acts Amended), standing in the name of the honourable member for The Pas, who has 26 minutes remaining.

**Ms. Amanda Lathlin (The Pas):** Once again, I have to describe this as a very odd session. I'd rather be in Estimates practising our democratic right to hold the ministers accountable on their budgets.

It's an honour to put a few words on Bill 22, The Business Registration, Supervision and Ownership Transparency Act. When it comes to ensuring that our local businesses thrive, transparency is incredibly important. We need to be encouraging Manitobans to participate in our local economy and build businesses.

We respect ownership and transparency by supporting local businesses. Co-ops contribute to the rich social fabric of the city. In fact, there's been numerous times that this certain business called Pollock's Hardware has been mentioned a few times when it comes to co-ops. It's had—it's been a staple in the community for nearly 100 years, for example.

Madam Speaker, On this side of the House, transparency is necessary to improving local organizations. Manitobans deserve to know who owns the business that they frequent. In fact, people are becoming more conscious about what—about where they spend their money. They want to support organizations that help their local community and, in fact, co-ops are essential way to do that.

As the nature of work and jobs are changing, local industry is essential in supporting our economy and regards to ensuring that our local businesses thrive. I come from a small town of The Pas and Opaskwayak Cree Nation, and there's one particular local business that has been around for many, many generations, and I might age myself once I mention that. In fact, I just want to mention the Grub Box. It's a grocery store. I remember it very much so. When I was a little girl, I used to go in there with my *câpân*, my great-grandmother, just specifically for the bakery and, more specifically, the staff.

As far as I remember, the evidence of a successful local business is how long their staff are there. I—their staff have been there for 20 years and even more than 30 years, and as somebody who went to the Scott Bateman Middle School and Margaret Barbour Collegiate, which is both schools base—nearby the Grub Box, everyday we went there for lunch—spring, rain, snow, blizzard, you would still go there to have lunch.

And I swear that some of the staff that I've seen there as a teenager and to now, when I do my grocery shopping there, I don't know if some of them are—have aged at all, seriously. And the same business was honoured last year, 2018, in the community of The Pas as the Business of the Year.

And it's very personable when you go there, Madam Speaker, if you ever have the chance to go there. The staff are excellent. They actually supply carry-out services, which is something—which is very useful when you're a busy mom.

So, with that, I just wanted to read something a little bit more about this amazing business and to tell you why they received the Business of the Year, and I'm just going to read from their website: They provide consistency and top-notch service to all of our customers striving to find products meeting customers' needs and providing a personal shopping experience for everyone. This exceptional service to our customers in The Pas and surrounding communities has, without a doubt, made the Grub Box the store what it is today.

And along with their unique program they have—it's called a frequent shopper program. Several years ago, our frequent shopper program was created to help raise funds for The Pas minor hockey. The concept of this program was, and still is, to give 5 per cent of customer purchases back to the group requesting funds. This program has evolved from a few hockey teams into a multi-user program consisting of 100 non-profit organizations. The frequent shopper program is a great way for user groups to meet their fundraising goals. The more frequently a group shops, the more money is raised for their needs. It's a win-win program for everyone. The Grub Box is proud to say that this program generates over \$30,000 per year to user groups in The Pas and surrounding areas.

And a history of the store is the Grub Box grocery store was built by Gary Morrish and local tradesmen from The Pas in 1973. The doors were open for business on December 18th, one week

before Christmas of that year. The Grub Box featured an in-store butcher shop, fresh produce section, and it has grown over the years but has always maintained its exceptional customer service and support for the community.

The Grub Box is a family business, employing family, friends, high school students and seniors alike. Bruce and Barb Morrish purchased the Grub Box from Gary and Flo Morrish in February 2007, and continue to run the store with the same principles that has contributed to his businesses.

I just wanted to say, too, that the Grub Box has also contributed just about every week to donate its extra produce to the soup kitchen, Living Water church, as well.

So those are just one of the important aspects why it's so important to support our local businesses because of what they do for their own community and especially with the staff and customers as well.

And another local business I wanted to talk about, about supporting local businesses, is Funky Threadz in The Pas. It's actually owned by a childhood friend of mine I went to grade 8 with. His name is Jerome Conaty.

And it absolutely—it sells brand-name clothes, shoes, hats and other products as well. And I just wanted to say that I've known Jerome since grade 8, and it's just wonderful to see how his business has thrived and how he just loves it when us local people enter his store and say thank you for shopping locally. And there's even a sign out on his store that says that as well. And, also too, his business was also recognized a few years back as Business of the Year.

So back to—

**An Honourable Member:** Has he asked for Bill 22?

**Ms. Lathlin:** Yes.

Investing in local businesses, like I just said—like I just said—is vital to ensuring the sustainability and success of our local economy. This government has a history of hiding from transparency and accountability, which is why it is ironic that they're bringing a—forward a bill with a focus on ownership transparency.

They also have a history of hiding from transparency and accountability, such as they continue to hide the truth about the closure of Concordia and Seven Oaks ERs from Manitobans. The Premier (Mr. Pallister) has repeatedly misled



Manitobans about his communications habits while in Costa Rica.

The NDP support more ownership and transparency in our economy, on this side of the House. Financial co-operatives, such as credit unions, offer sustainable finance for local people. They—and they are run by and for people at a community level and offer a safe approach to savings and loans.

\* (16:20)

As in—regards to co-ops, co-operatives offer an alternative to the standard business model operated and for local communities. The structure of co-ops is unique to other businesses, such as they are voluntary organizations open to all people who are able to use services being provided and willing to accept the responsibility associated with the membership.

They also facilitate more equitable working environments, as they are democratic organizations controlled by their members, who actively participate in setting the policies for the co-op. Members contribute equitably to and democratically control the capital of their co-operatives.

Because co-operatives are run by and for the members, the profits generated stay local and are invested in the co-operative, the community or distributed to local 'owners'—owners. We should be investing in these co-operatives as a way to strengthen our local economy, especially in a time when local businesses are struggling more than ever to stay open.

With this bill, the register—the registrar is no longer required to act as an adviser to co-ops or provide model forms of articles and bylaws to co-operatives. Eliminating the requirement of the registrar to act as an adviser could mean the new co-ops who are just getting started will have fewer resources available to them.

This is concerning because we need to be supporting co-ops at—as best we can, instead of hindering the potential of their success. We need to make it easier for people to create sustainable, equitable co-operatives. Because co-ops are created by and for community members, they become invaluable to the communities they serve.

There are several examples of successful co-ops in Manitoba that have become woven into the fabric of the community. For example, again, Pollock's

Hardware has been mentioned many—numerous times within the House as an example. It is a vital part of the Winnipeg's North End community. After Pollock's operating for 97 years, the board members moved to close the co-operative earlier this year.

However, despite facing economic challenges, community members rallied to keep it open. It wasn't the first time the store had nearly closed. Over a decade ago, it was on the brink of closing, but it was then saved by the community and converted to a co-op. Pollock's Hardware has lasted twice as long as most small businesses who are forced to compete with retail giants in today's markets.

Another example is organic planet food co-op. It's another co-operative in Winnipeg that has been able to survive in this economy because of community support. It has been operating in Wolseley for over 30 years, serving the community as a place to find fair trade, organic foods. It is a long-running and successful model of community-building, and collectively work to meet the needs of that community.

Considering that the current market threatening the survival of so many local businesses, we need to be doing all we can to support success of the business that are just starting up, which is why we are troubled by this bill's elimination of the registrar's requirement to act as an adviser to the co-operatives.

Manitoba's Red River Co-op is one of our biggest success stories. For example, earlier this year, Red River Co-op revealed that members were getting back more money than ever before. They sent out 233,000 cheques totalling \$35.7 million. Members got back about 9 cents per litre of gas they purchased in 2018, plus 2 per cent on food purchased and 5 per cent on the full price of pharmacy purchases.

Red River Co-op CEO Doug Wiebe said that, quote, as a co-operative, we are proud to be a different kind of business that shares profits with our members, ensuring the money stays in the communities we serve and enriching those communities, end quote. In 2018, Red River Co-op also added three new food stores in Lorette, Selkirk and Stonewall.

Red River Co-op represents a kind of business model that many of us benefit from. It is truly local business, built by the community and for the community. We should be trying to foster this kind

of success among other co-operatives they are starting.

In regards to support local businesses, this government has a history of local—of hurting local co-operatives that are essential to Manitoba's local economy. In their last budget, Manitoba's credit unions were blindsided when it was announced that a special deduction they received would be phased out by 2023. Because of the elimination of this deduction, credit unions will have to pay an additional \$15 million in provincial corporate income tax. They will go from having to pay 1 per cent tax on net earnings of over \$400,000 to paying 12 per cent by 2023.

A special tax deduction allowed credit unions to pay a lower rate of tax on a portion of their income, intended to give them a chance to survive in the competitive financial services industry. The CEO of Credit Union Central of Manitoba, Garth Manness, said the announcement was a shock. Manness said that the assistance from the deduction is still required. He said I—he said, quote, our primary competitors, the banks, have access to capital markets and have many more vehicles in order to build their capital base, but the co-op financial institutions are structured differently than corporate financial institutions. The way for credit unions to build equity is primarily through building retained earnings, end quote.

Since 2008 economic crisis, financial institutions across the globe are now compelled to greater amounts of equity capital as security against their loan portfolio. In the case of Manitoba, that has gone up from 8 per cent to 11.5 per cent. Manness was quoted saying, we have really only one clear mechanism to get the best form of capital; that is through retained earnings. And taxing away our income just makes it much more difficult for us to meet those targets, end quote.

Credit unions have become an integral part of so many communities, and they are making available important financing to many businesses in the province. Members should not have been hit with such a significant tax increase. Our credit unions are Manitoba success stories who continue to help the Manitoba economy.

And, in regards to this government's lack of transparency, this bill partly focuses on ownership transparency, which is ironic, again, and hypocritical, considering that the members of this government continue to be evasive and avoid

transparency. Manitobans expect their political leaders to follow the law and be open and transparent about their financial dealings.

For example—it has to be said, Madam Speaker—the Premier (Mr. Pallister) threatened to sue the Winnipeg Free Press for publishing a story that said he hadn't paid his taxes. It soon came out that the story was true. The Premier had to pay back roughly \$8,000 in back taxes. Paying the tax relies on the honour system, and the tax is designed to raise funds for the poor. It has been in effect for roughly 10 years.

The Premier discarded The Legislative Assembly and Executive Council Conflict of Interest Act and misled Manitobans over the nature of his personal financial holdings, as well as his financial interests in Costa Rica. For years, the Premier provided incomplete conflict-of-interest filings, hiding his Costa Rica assets as required by law. Manitobans only learned the truth through a Costa Rican newspaper which revealed undeclared assets, two holding companies in Costa Rica which contained three properties, including a residence in the coastal area of the Pacific coast of Costa Rica.

The Premier only disclosed his Costa Rica assets after he got caught, and he continues to double down, adding them to his filings as voluntary closures.

\* (16:30)

So, in regards to this bill, there's a few important questions that still remain to be answered. And a few of those questions, when this bill was introduced, were: With whom did the minister consult with when developing this bill?

Another question that needs to be answered is: What are the implications of eliminating the requirement of the registrar to act as an adviser for co-operatives? Another question is: Will there be another advisory report—supports put in place for people who are starting co-operatives? And co-operatives are an alternative to the standard business model in that they promote community involvement and equitable management.

Can the minister explain how this government is supporting development of co-operatives?

And also another question that should be asked is: Could the minister explain how the federal changes improve co-operatives and corporations' ownership transparency?

And another question is: Could the minister please provide an example—an explanation of a company that would fall under the changes to extra-provincial registrations?

So, again, Madam Speaker, these are—I just labelled and put on record questions that still remain to be answered.

And with that it is—I am proud and honoured to put a few words on record in regards to Bill 22. And I'll sit down and let me—other fellow colleagues to debate this bill.

Thank you.

**Madam Speaker:** The honourable leader—just a reminder to the House that the honourable Leader of the Official Opposition has indicated his unlimited speaking time has been allocated to the honourable member for Minto (Mr. Swan).

I will now recognize the honourable Leader of the Official Opposition.

**Mr. Wab Kinew (Leader of the Official Opposition):** I do thank you, Madam Speaker, for reminding us that that unlimited speaking time will go to my great colleague from Minto, who has certainly got a lot to say about Bill 22, and many other issues, for that matter.

And, in fact, there's so many members on this side who have so much to say that I just so often look forward to sharing that unlimited speaking time with our good colleagues. We know that the member for Flin Flon (Mr. Lindsey) has used unlimited speaking time to great effect in the past, that the member for St. Johns (Ms. Fontaine) has used unlimited speaking time to great effect in the past. And now we have the member for Minto who will look to outdo our colleague from Steinbach, who is a noted user of unlimited speaking time in this Chamber—of course, in past legislatures, not this one.

So I rise today to put a few remarks on the record regarding Bill 22, The Business Registration, Supervision and Ownership Transparency Act. I'm sure many of our colleagues have already made some points about corporations in Costa Rica and, you know, steps that could be taken to ensure the transparency of ownership of those business entities.  
*[interjection]*

I see that colleagues on the opposite side are raising their voices. I guess they too have many questions about, you know, which ATV belongs to which foreign-controlled entity and which piece of

property is being developed by which foreign corporation. These are all things that have been, I guess, highlighted in the media in the past. That—but that is not exactly what's before us in the form of this bill here.

What I do believe is bringing this bill forward is the government having another example of sort of a rushed, incomplete, perhaps hare-brained approach to matters in the province. I'm not talking about health care in this instance, though all of those descriptors would neatly apply to the health-care disorganization that this government has rushed into place. Rather, I'm talking about the government's approach to the implementation of the New West Partnership.

It would seem that, well, the government, you know, just couldn't wait to, you know, ship the jobs of many electricians out of the province and, you know, degrade and erode health and safety regulations for many workers in the province. While they were in such a rush to make many changes that actually protected workers here in Manitoba, they did, of course, forget to harmonize all pieces of legislative statute here in Manitoba to ensure compliance with the New West Partnership, which is, for some reason, like, one of the reasons that Conservative politicians get out of bed in the morning.

On this side of the House, we get out of bed to stand up for health care, to stand up for education. We get out of bed to stand up for jobs, to stand up for working people.

On the other side, I guess, they really, really get excited by bureaucratic language that applies to interprovincial trade disputes. That's perhaps a difference in style. Perhaps it's also indicative of a difference in values. But I'm very much committed to standing up for health care, education and jobs.

So, as I was saying, the government has botched another one of their many files. In this instance, they are now, because they're planning to call an early election, trying to rush through this piece of legislation which ostensibly none of them realized was necessary until they did realize that the Premier's (Mr. Pallister) plan to bring forward this early election in contravention of the fixed-election-date law, a fixed-election-date law that I would point out was passed by Gary Doer, probably the most popular former premier in Manitoba's history—New Democratic premier, I would add—also in contravention of an election platform commitment set

down in black and white in the platform that the Premier (Mr. Pallister) and the members opposite campaigned on explicitly, which means that, as the old saying goes, the members on that side went door to door, knock, knock, knocking on each and every one of those doors, and they promised—you know, on this side of the House, we're still working on the door knocking routine bit.

We're a little busy cataloguing all the damage to the health-care system and standing up for all the nurses who email us and, you know, cry out for help stopping the emergency room closures. We haven't had enough time to do, you know, the little call-and-response routines. However, on the other side, because they're so silent about the closures of Concordia and so silent about the closures of Seven Oaks, they've got plenty of time to work on those routines over there on that side.

So, anyways, on the eleventh hour—perhaps it was the twelfth hour—anyways, it was very last minute—this government realized, hey, if the Legislature rises without us harmonizing all of these different rules with what's happening in other provinces, we may actually see the New West Partnership deal fall apart.

We know that we're going to lose the next election to the NDP—I'm paraphrasing what was going on in the Premier's office and the Cabinet room there. But I think it went something like, listen, we know they have us—we know this NDP party has us beat when it comes to health care, when it comes to education, when it comes to the priorities of Manitobans; we're going to lose power in a misguided early election call, and this whole New West Partnership thing that is the only reason most of us get out of bed in the morning is going to go up in smoke, and so we better dot the i's and cross the t's in order to ensure that this actually comes to pass.

So, anyways, I think you understand the—what I'm going for here, what the gist of the situation is. The government did not actually realize that there were certain responsibilities on their part after entering the New West Partnership, other interprovincial trade agreements.

And so they have to amend some statutes in order to ensure that these pieces of legislation are harmonized across provincial barriers. Again, it's only because the Premier has such a desire to go to the polls immediately and, you know, lose the Premier's office so quickly that we are now being forced to debate this legislation day after day.

I'd pause here for a second just to reflect on the odd nature of the Conservative legislative agenda. You know, one day, we're talking about, you know, business registration; the next day, you know, we're amending, you know, statutes; we're correcting certain language changes in the statutes.

Absent from anything in this government's agenda is—well, two things: one is vision and a willingness to chart a bold direction for Manitoba in the face of technology change, which is changing the workplace, in the face of climate change, which is changing our environment; and just to keep up with the dreams, hopes, visions and aspirations that young people in our province have.

\* (16:40)

And so the government completely misses the mark on the question of having a vision. You listen to them in question period, they're still using the same talking points from the last election. And so I guess that was their peak.

But we also know that absent this government's legislative agenda, there's also a little thing called Estimates, and, you know, time was, you know, governments of the day very much looked forward to governing, which seems like such a foreign concept now. Governments actually looked forward to governing. As a result, they would be proud of their budgets when they brought them forward.

And, typically, they would actually be willing to defend their budgets and take their budgets through the Estimates process. However, the government passed their budget this year. They were expecting like a ticker tape parade and a hero's welcome. It fell flat; let's be honest, government's budget this year fell pretty flat.

Even the government members themselves can't reliably be counted on to cheer for a given Premier or a minister in question period these days, so deflated are they on that side of the House. And as a result, that malaise has crept from the caucus room into the Cabinet room and into the Premier's office, and because of that, they've also seen fit to not call Estimates.

And as a result we're back before the House, you know, debating pieces of legislation like this one, which I'm sure you could make an argument for this being important in some way but, you know, is this more important than the principles of democracy, principles of accountability, principles of good government? You know, I'll be charitable, and I'll

just say that that's an open question, one that we don't need to resolve immediately, but we can perhaps just leave on the table for now and we'll return to them later.

We know that, you know, local businesses are very important to each and every one of our constituencies. In Fort Rouge, the great constituency of Fort Rouge, I'm very proud to call among my constituents, apart from many, many great Manitobans, some great business owners, and so, you know, the owner of Little Sister is a great example, young woman, Vanessa, who started up that coffee shop a few years ago. She was sort of on the leading edge of that third wave of coffee shops here in Winnipeg and Manitoba. It's sort of a hipster Cheers, you might say. You can go there on a given day and you'll see the familiar faces. Instead of Norm, we've got Alain, who's in there just about every day.

And, you know, this is a young, progressive business owner who's creating jobs in the community, has expanded to a second location in the great constituency of Fort Garry-Riverview. They're doing, you know, gangbusters in terms of their sales in both locations, doing very well.

I know also that there's tons of professionals working in my constituency, be they, you know, architects or physicians or, you know, dentists, and so they have some really cool, you know, businesses. And recently we've seen a proliferation of a bunch of cannabis retailers in Fort Rouge too, for whatever reason. I was out here in a scrum one day, and the Premier (Mr. Pallister) said, hey, there's so many cannabis stores in Osborne Village, there's almost as many as there are Wab Kinew signs. And I said, not so fast there, Mr. Premier. You can't say a member's name in the Chamber. But it's okay; nobody's listening. Literally. It's okay if you say it in the third person.

And, so anyway, all that to say, there's many businesses in Fort Rouge which are, you know, contributing to the economy, creating jobs, and also, I would add, you know, maybe on an intangible sort of level, they're also boosting pride in the area because when we can look down the street, you can see, you know, Green Carrot, owned by Obby Khan or you can see, you know, Vanessa's store Little Sister or you could see on Corydon, you know, the Café 22/Pizza Hotline place. Regardless of all those owners' political stripes or, you know, partisan

affiliations, it does mean for a pretty good quality of life in our area.

So we sort of have a friendly competition with the constituency of Minto as to who has the claim for best restaurants in the area.

**An Honourable Member:** Still winning.

**Mr. Kinew:** The member for Minto (Mr. Swan) claims that it's Minto, and I'll grant him that, you know, Viva and, I guess—what else have you got? Pho minh?

**An Honourable Member:** Pho Binh Minh.

**Mr. Kinew:** Pho Binh Minh.

**An Honourable Member:** Sargent Taco.

**Mr. Kinew:** Sargent Taco. Okay, that's a decent list, but how about this, Madam Speaker? There's 529, Segovia, Cornerstone, Green Carrot, the entire Corydon strip—tough to argue with that list of restaurants there.

And then, once the boundaries change and Fort Rouge will gain Vera Pizza and BMC Market, we'll have two Safeways in it. I mean, sky's the limit there, so we'll have to reconvene in the next Legislature and do an updated debate on which local restaurant list tops which in which constituency.

But all that to say a simple point: at some point or another, all these restaurants had to register their business names with the Companies Office in Manitoba. And so we know that that will be affected by this bill here. And, of course, we know that there are many other businesses right across the province who are being impacted by this piece of proposed legislation.

I would also note that co-ops are affected by this bill. The Cooperatives Act is amended so that there could be a superintendent of co-operatives. And it's kind of interesting to have the government, which refuses to co-operate with anybody, try and bring down suggestions for co-operation and co-operatives, but we can set that aside for question period.

I'm sure it's a topic that we'll return to in the remaining days of this Legislature, and point out all the different ways in which this government has failed to work well with the mayor's office, with the Prime Minister's office, with Sandy Riley's office, with Polly Craik's office, with all these other folks.

But they have sought fit to bring in some changes to the way co-operatives are administered here in Manitoba that have to do with supervision of financial matters, the issuing of securities, the oversight of memberships for housing co-operatives, and that sets out that the registrar is no longer required to act as an adviser to co-operatives or provide model forms of articles and bylaws to co-operatives.

All of these changes, I assume, are ones that co-ops have been asking for. And, certainly, we know that housing co-ops are a great way for affordable housing and, you know, rent-geared-to-income units and social housing to appear on the map and to ensure that every Manitoban fulfills their right to housing.

I would note here, though, that it appears that the government has overlooked some of the asks that those in the co-op sector do have. One example—and again, it's my love of coffee coming to the fore here—one of them was shared with me by a coffee shop owner. Again, this is a young entrepreneur who is part of the third wave of coffee shops—hipster coffee shops, if we might call them that.

And it turns out that he actually wanted to set his business up as a co-op rather than as a corporation; however, he would not be able to access start-up financing if he took that co-op business structure. And, just as an aside, this business owner did incorporate, so he did set up a corporation. And sort of, as a trade off, if you will, because he wasn't able to do the workers co-op that he wanted, he decided to set his corporation up with certain progressive ethics.

So (1) they committed to a living wage for all their employees, which, you know, some coffee shops, I guess, maybe Tim Hortons, don't necessarily pay a living wage. However, this business owner did decide to pay a living wage.

And they also decided to govern their corporation using triple-bottom-line accounting. So that means, yes, they do report on their financials, but they also report on their environmental impact. So recycling and, you know, emissions and all those things, the impact that they're having on that front—and then also a social bottom line as well, so seeking to have a positive social impact on the community.

So actually, this is a very model business, if you will, that this entrepreneur is kind of doing all these great things. He's paying his workers well. He's

having a positive impact on society. He's having a positive impact on the environment.

\* (16:50)

However, I would note that perhaps there are some other changes to The Cooperatives Act that the government may have considered and perhaps could have talked to credit unions, financial institutions as well, because it does seem to me that as we move forward in our economy, as we take seriously the changes that millennials are looking forward to and Generation Z is looking forward to, that's coming to work, we do have to change our practices and we do have to change our statutes in Manitoba so that they could keep pace.

So, as an example, we know the gig economy is increasing. It's increasingly prevalent. This government passed the Uber bill, if you will. And as a result, we now see Uber Eats, Skip the Dishes and other food delivery services here. We also see, like, TappCar and those kind of ride-hailing apps here in Winnipeg. We have yet to see the big players like Uber and Lyft come to Manitoba, but we do see some of the smaller actors like TappCar operating here.

But that's all part of a change in our economy that is being led by some really big international tech companies which are making themselves very profitable at the expense of paying their workers a living wage, for lack of a time to go on and on and detail the manner in which they are being paid. Essentially, they're being paid piecework, and it's not enough to get by—particularly, once you account for the expenses of auto insurance and vehicle maintenance and vehicle ownership itself.

So, if young people are being forced into the service sector—meaning, the days of having manufacturing jobs and, you know, a full career with 30 years and a pension and benefits appear less achievable for many millennials and many members of Gen Z, if it's more likely they're going to be part of the gig economy, if it's more likely they're going to be part of the contract economy—and, certainly, that was my experience after I went to university. People said, go to university, you go to university, there'll be a great job for you waiting on the other end of it.

Turned out that wasn't the case. I had to kind of work my way up from the bottom doing, like, piecework and contracts and, you know, just kind of patching different jobs together to try and make a

living for many years until I actually was lucky enough to build a good career and become successful; worked many different jobs over that period.

But, if that's more and more the case, it seems to me that we as government need to move the laws that govern businesses in our province forward so that we can open up other forms of opportunity for young people—young entrepreneurs, in particular—to set up business models that are going to work for them.

And, because we know that our economy is pivoting towards technology—so, even industries that are not tech industries, whether it's finance or agriculture or manufacturing—even those industries are becoming increasingly technology-oriented and they use different forms of software and hardware in their operations—and we also factor in to the impact of climate change, meaning some emphasis on reducing emissions and being conscious about our environment—all of that taken together should suggest that we want to create a situation where people—for sure, if you want to go incorporate, set up a corporation, run your business that way, do it in an environmentally, socially responsible way, pay your workers a living wage, have at it.

However, if you also want to do a co-op that maybe is tech forward—tech facing—also environmentally friendly, you're probably going to need some start-up capital to do that. You would be able to—you would need to be able to access start-up financing.

And so, that, to me, suggests that one of the other changes to The Cooperatives Act that, you know, this House should consider in the near future should be to change the statutes and regulations so that it's more easy for a group of young people to organize also under a co-operative model and to be able to access start-up financing so that they could scale up such a business.

However, that's not included in this piece of legislation, so I'll merely include it on the record as a note, as an FYI, if you will.

We also know that there's some changes in this bill that have to do with ownership transparency and that, again, some of the changes in this bill have to do with the registration of businesses across, you know, provincial lines. For us here, you know, those things are all well and good. But what we do hope is that there can be a heavy emphasis on the

government run out of this building in the Manitoba Legislature—that Manitoba's government could really prioritize Manitoba jobs for Manitobans and could really stand up for jobs.

Again, one of the reasons why we want to focus on jobs rather than just on the economic growth that they would talk about on the other side is when you talk about economic growth in the abstract without tying that to job creation, you can create a situation of great income inequality because that economic growth—there's no guarantee that that won't all be accreted into a very small group of people.

However, if you are big believers in economic growth, as we are on this side of the House, but you also tie it to job creation, that is the best way to ensure that the benefits of economic growth flow across society and do ensure that there is more equality, economically speaking, across all different manners of our society.

And I remember in one of my first speeches during this legislative session, when I was sitting way in the back row over where my friend from Fort Garry-Riverview now likes to call home and actually, I think, has more fun on some days, but, anyways, way back there, just a few short years ago, I do remember talking about Thomas Piketty, the French economist, whose book *Capital in Twenty-First Century*, essentially sets out several, like, economic formulae, and I'm using the Latin pluralization of formula for the good folks in Hansard there, so he does set out these formulae.

And one of them that I think is most germane to the conversation here today is that, you know, the rate of return on capital is almost always higher than the rate of return on labour across all Western societies such—and this is going back over hundreds of years of economic data that he's reviewed—such that, even if that spread is minuscule, like .001 per cent per year, that in the aggregate over a time scale of decades and even centuries, that that's where you get economic inequality arising from.

That's where you get income inequality arising from because those gains, albeit very small year upon year, begin to accrete and then they begin to compound, and as anybody who sat there, you know, hitting the return button on a calculator when calculating compound interest will have observed, the compounding effect of a percentage increase year over year when spanned out over decades or centuries, is a remarkable force.

And so all that to say that one of the things that I think that this government would do well to consider is to create, in bills like this one, where they have the opportunity to do so, to set out more of an emphasis on the creation of jobs, and not just on the generation of profits because, again, profits themselves could flow to a small group of people. Job creation—that is more widely felt, more widely shared.

So, in my own life experience, I've had the great opportunity to, you know, create work for people over the years and to hire people and, you know, whether as, you know, my own business activities, you know, producing videos and, you know, working on apps and stuff like that, and even hiring, you know, subcontractors to do things like graphic design, certainly that's been a big learning experience for me, and it's helped me to develop an understanding of what it takes to operate in the modern business environment; what it takes to go out there and, you know, shake the trees for leads and contracts and to build a business; what it takes to, you know, operate things in terms of management side; what it takes in terms of the HR in managing people side.

All that's been very good, and I know the government likes to talk often about, like, you know, how, you know, job creators on this side and those on the other side don't know anything about creating jobs. Well, that's not really true, I guess is what I'm trying to say here. It's not true. The only difference is I don't view myself as somehow being morally

superior just because I've created, you know, opportunities for other people. In fact, I believe all human beings are equal before their God and here on this planet earth.

So that's, maybe, a pretty religious, philosophical place to arrive at when it comes to a simple bill on business registrations, but it does get that deep sometimes when you're hanging out with me, Madam Speaker. We do sometimes jump from a relatively straightforward piece of legislation to all of a sudden comprehending what is our place here in the universe, and how can we advance that here in the Manitoba Legislature, and I'll make no apologies for that.

So I guess one of the other pieces that I would add here is while we do think about business structures and, of course, like, I guess the administrative work that government needs to do to track who owns these pieces of, I guess, corporate entities and things like that, it is important that we also keep one eye towards the work that needs to be done to strengthen our economy for the future.

My concern—

**Madam Speaker:** Order, please.

When this matter is again before the House, the honourable member will have two minutes remaining.

The hour being 5 p.m., this House is adjourned and stands adjourned until 10 a.m. tomorrow.



# LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

Monday, May 27, 2019

## CONTENTS

<b>ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS</b>			
<b>Introduction of Bills</b>		Northern Health Care	
		Lathlin	2133
		Friesen	2133
Bill 217—The Manitoba Hydro Amendment Act		Climate and Green Plan	
Lindsey	2125	Lamont	2133
		Squires	2134
<b>Committee Reports</b>		Northern Job Losses	
Standing Committee on Social and Economic Development		Lindsey	2135
		Fielding	2135
First Report		Friesen	2135
Smook	2125	PST Reduction	
		Teitsma	2136
<b>Members' Statements</b>		Fielding	2136
Paul Chapman		Methamphetamine Addiction Services	
Ewasko	2126	Klassen	2136
Danny Schur		Cullen	2136
Allum	2126	Fixed Election Date	
Pembina Valley Twisters MMJHL Champions		Swan	2137
Martin	2127	Cullen	2137
Gloria Cardwell-Hoeppner		<b>Matter of Privilege</b>	
Swan	2127	Fletcher	2138
Teulon's 100th Anniversary		Goertzen	2139
Eichler	2128	<b>Petitions</b>	
<b>Oral Questions</b>		Daylight Saving Time	
Concordia Hospital ER		Graydon	2140
Kinew	2129	Early Learning and Child-Care Programs	
Friesen	2129	Allum	2140
Concordia and Seven Oaks Hospitals		Lamont	2141
Kinew	2129	Altemeyer	2141
Friesen	2129	Lathlin	2141
Health-Care Reform		F. Marcelino	2142
Kinew	2130	T. Marcelino	2142
Friesen	2130	Tina Fontaine—Public Inquiry	
Methamphetamine Addiction		Fontaine	2143
Fontaine	2131	Early Learning and Child-Care Programs	
Friesen	2131	Swan	2143
Cullen	2132	Lindsey	2144
Lifelight Air Ambulance		Quality Health Care	
Lathlin	2132	Wiebe	2144
Friesen	2132	Early Learning and Child-Care Programs	
		Gerrard	2144

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**  
**GOVERNMENT BUSINESS**

**Debate on Second Readings**

Bill 22—The Business Registration, Supervision  
and Ownership Transparency Act (Various Acts  
Amended)

Lathlin	2145
Kinew	2149

The Legislative Assembly of Manitoba Debates and Proceedings  
are also available on the Internet at the following address:

**<http://www.manitoba.ca/legislature/hansard/hansard.html>**